

Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation

Advancing Free Trade for Asia-Pacific **Prosperity** 

# Bridging the Gender Gap: Gender Mainstreaming and Women Empowerment as a Game Changer in Anti-Corruption Initiatives

Putrajaya, Malaysia | 11-12 February 2020

APEC Anti-Corruption and Transparency Experts Working Group APEC Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy November 2020 APEC Project: ACT 01 2019A

Produced by

Chuah Chang Man Project Contractor

And

Policy, Planning and Research Division Malaysian Anti-Corruption Commission Head Quarters Putrajaya, Malaysia Tel: (60) 03 8870 0012 Email: actwg2020macc@gmail.com

For Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation Secretariat 35 Heng Mui Keng Terrace Singapore 119616 Tel: (65) 68919 600 Fax: (65) 68919 690 Email: <u>info@apec.org</u> Website: <u>www.apec.org</u>

© 2020 APEC Secretariat

APEC# 220-AC-01.1

# TABLE CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations	i-ii
Background	1
1.0. Introduction	2-4
1.1. Purpose	2
1.2. Scope	3
1.3. Objectives	3-4
2.0. Processes and Methodology of Policy Recommendation	5
3.0. Key Policy Recommendations on Gender Mainstreaming and Women Empowerment to	6 1 2
Fight Corruption	6-13
3.1. Recommendation 1	6
3.1.1. Enabling mechanism	6
3.1.2. Views of syndicate participants to be considered	6
3.1.3. Examples of Institutionalization of Gender Mainstreaming	6
3.2. Recommendation 2	7
3.2.1. Enabling mechanism	7
3.2.2. Views of syndicate participants to be considered	7
3.2.3. Examples of Criminalization of Sextortion	7
3.3. Recommendation 3	8
3.3.1. Enabling mechanism	8
3.3.2. Views of syndicate participants to be considered	8
3.3.3. Examples of Empowerment of Women and Grassroots Women Organizations	8
3.4. Recommendation 4	9
3.4.1. Enabling mechanism	9
3.4.2. Views of syndicate participants to be considered	9
3.4.3. Examples of Gender – Sensitive Anti- Corruption Reporting Framework	9
3.5. Recommendation 5	10
3.5.1. Enabling mechanism	10
3.5.2. Views of syndicate participants to be considered	10
3.5.3. Examples of SDD or GDD Collection and Analysis Framework	10
3.6. Recommendation 6	11
3.6.1. Enabling mechanism	11
3.6.2. Views of syndicate participants to be considered	11
3.6.3. Examples of Gender Equality in Recruitment	11
3.7. Recommendation 7	12
3.7.1. Enabling mechanism	12
3.7.2. Views of syndicate participants to be considered	12
3.7.3. Examples of Gender Sensitive Training	12

3.8. Recomm	nendation 8	13
3.8.1. Enabling mechanism		
3.8.2. View	s of syndicate participants to be considered	13
3.8.3. Exar	nples of Gender Responsive Budgeting	13
4.0. Conclusi	on and Way Forward	14
Bibliography.		15-17
Appendix A:	Stocktaking Survey Report	18-47
Appendix B:	Good Practices of Gender mainstreaming and Women Empowerment in APEC Economies	48-62
Appendix C:	Gender mainstreaming and Women Empowerment from the International Organization's Perspective	63-65
Appendix D:	Enabling Mechanisms of the Key Policy Recommendations on Gender Mainstreaming and Women Empowerment to Fight Corruption	66-72

# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AAC	Agency Against Corruption
ACTWG	Anti-Corruption and Transparency Experts Working Group
APSC	Australian Public Service Commission
APS	Australian Public Service
APEC	Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation
ASIC	Australian Securities and Investment Commission
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
СЕМ	Centro de Emergencia Mujer en Comisarias (Mexico)
CSO	Civil Society Organizations
DOJ	The Department of Justice (United States)
GAD	Gender and Development
GBA	Gender Based Assessment
GESI	Gender Equity and Social Inclusion Policy
GFPS	Gender and Development Focal Point System
GID	Gender Information Desk
GIG	Gender Inclusion Guidelines
GDD	Gender Disaggregated Data
GRB	Gender Responsive Budgeting
GST+	Gender Sensitivity Training Plus
G-WAR	Gerakan Anti Rasuah Wanita (Malaysia)
ISO	International Standardization Organization
KPWKM	Ministry of Women, Family and Community Development (Malaysia)
LBGTQ2	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer (or sometimes questioning), Two-Spirited. (Canada)
LGUs	Local Government Units (The Republic of the Philippines)
MACC	Malaysian Anti-Corruption Commission
ΝΑΤΟ	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NACP	National Anti - Corruption Plan (Malaysia)
NGO	Non-Government Organization
OECD	The Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
PACPO	Public Assistance and Corruption Prevention Office
PPWE	Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy
SDD	Sex Disaggregated Data
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
SPAK	Saya, "Perempuan Anti Korupsi" (Indonesia)

SOM	Senior Officials Meeting
SOPs	Standard Operating Procedures
ті	Transparency International
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UN	United Nations
UN Women	The United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women
UNODC	The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
UNCAC	United Nations Convention against Corruption
USAID	United States Agency for International Development

## BACKGROUND

The Symposium on "Gender Mainstreaming and Women Empowerment to Fight Corruption", as part of the APEC-funded project (ACT 01 2019A) was organized by the Anti-Corruption and Transparency Experts Working Group (ACTWG) Malaysia on the margins of SOM1 APEC from 11-12 February 2020 in Putrajaya, Malaysia. It was a collaborative effort between two fora, namely, the ACTWG and the Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy (PPWE) with the twin objectives of (i) capacity building for APEC economies and their law enforcement agencies and (ii) the formulation of policy recommendations on gender mainstreaming and women empowerment to fight corruption.

The Symposium aimed to amplify women empowerment in the fight against corruption based on the findings of the following methodology:

- a) A stocktaking survey which was conducted prior to the Symposium to assess the status of integration of gender mainstreaming and women empowerment to fight corruption from among the 21 APEC member economies.
- b) Plenary sessions (on day one) on three broad areas:
  - i. The international perspective of gender mainstreaming and women empowerment delivered by international experts on gender<sup>1</sup>;
  - ii. Women empowerment in the law enforcement, economic, political and social spheres from perspectives of the public and private sectors including women-led grassroots organization; and
  - iii. The implementation of gender mainstreaming policies and practices by policy makers and practitioners among APEC member economies.
- c) Syndicate discussions (on day two) by Symposium participants on a set of policy recommendations that were formulated based on the experts' opinions, good practices, and conclusions elucidated during the plenary sessions.

The Symposium involved the participation from 139 international and local participants who were comprised of international experts on gender, private sector, and public policy makers, women's group organizations, law enforcement and anti-corruption practitioners, and academia across 16 APEC member economies, namely Australia<sup>2</sup>; Brunei Darussalam; Canada; Chile; Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; Malaysia; Mexico; New Zealand; Peru; The Republic of the Philippines<sup>3</sup>; Russia; Singapore; Thailand; United States; and Viet Nam. International organizations, namely, UN Women, UNODC, and Transparency International (TI) – Berlin were invited to participate.

Resulting from the methodology mentioned above under paragraphs (a), (b) and (c), a list of eight policy recommendations on gender mainstreaming and women empowerment to fight corruption was formulated for consideration to be used as reference by ACTWG members in their future programme and work plans.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See Appendix C

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Participated via pre-recorded video.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Participated via pre-recorded video.

## **1.0. INTRODUCTION**

The ACTWG remains committed to the successful implementation of the Santiago Commitment to Fight Corruption and Ensure Transparency (2004), the APEC Course of Action on Fighting Corruption (2004), and the APEC Transparency Standards, as well as the implementation of the United Nations Convention against Corruption (UNCAC) and the 2014 Beijing Declaration on Fighting Corruption. Among the tasks of the ACTWG which form the basis of this project are:

- i. Develop innovative training, targeted capacity building and results-oriented technical assistance to fight corruption and ensure transparency; and
- ii. Facilitate cooperation between APEC fora on corruption issues and assist in making recommendations on proposals/projects to Senior Officials.

Gender inclusion, on the other hand, is already a mandate following the recommendation of the 1998 Ministerial Meeting on Women and the subsequent APEC Leader's directive in 1999 to develop a "Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC," which was tasked to the PPWE. The 1999 Framework was further complemented by the Gender Inclusion Guidelines (GIG) in 2017. The latter was succeeded by a renewed commitment to enhance women's participation in APEC processes via the La Serena Roadmap for Women and Inclusive Growth (2019-2030).

The implementation of the Framework, Guidelines and Roadmap, however, is not the responsibility of the PPWE alone but that of all APEC fora and of all women and men involved in APEC processes, policies, projects, and activities.

In fulfilling the mandates stated, it is incumbent upon the ACTWG, in collaboration with the PPWE, to introduce APEC member economies to the various aspects of gender inclusion in their anticorruption policies and strategies. These shall include not only information-sharing of good practices, but also capacity building that addresses the systematic barriers, including corruption, that limit the economic empowerment of women in the region.

### 1.1. PURPOSE

This publication lays out the scope, objectives, processes, and methodology in regard to the formulation of policy recommendations on gender mainstreaming and women empowerment to fight corruption that are derived from the outcomes and findings of the Symposium. The resultant policy recommendations that are formulated, in essence, represent the opinions, thoughts, and findings on the subject matter by international experts, private and public policy makers, women's group organizations, law enforcement and anti-corruption practitioners, and the academics who participated in the Symposium. The authors also supplemented the publication through desk research and other sources which is acknowledged in the footnotes and the bibliography.

### 1.2. SCOPE

The term "gender" refers to the socially determined differences between women and men in terms of their roles, attitudes, behaviours and values. The term "mainstream", in the APEC context, shall refer to "the set of dominant ideas, policies, practices, institutions and organizations in society which determine the allocation of resources and opportunities"<sup>4</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC (1999) p.2

For the purpose of this publication it shall adopt the term "gender mainstreaming" as defined in the Framework for Integration of Women in APEC to mean "women and men having equitable access to, and benefit from society's resources, opportunities and rewards and equal participation in influencing what is valued and in shaping the directions and decisions" and "incorporating gender perspectives into the goals, priorities, policies, decisions, practices, activities (including projects) and resource allocation as well as participation at all levels"<sup>5</sup>.

Women empowerment includes the process whereby women are afforded agency to participate and lead in decision-making processes. In the context of anticorruption policy initiatives for the purposes of this publication, empowerment of women to fight corruption will not see women as victims of corruption, but rather will tap women's potential as a solution to curbing corruption that impacts both women and society at large.

### 1.3. OBJECTIVES

Studies have shown that corruption affects men and women disproportionately. Women, usually those at grassroots level, more often than not, experience the onslaught of corruption as victims rather than perpetrators of the crime. However, rather than seeing women as victims, they should now be regarded as part of the solution in the fight against corruption<sup>6</sup>.

In addition, data collected by Omar Azfar, Steve Knack, Young Lee and Anand Swamy at IRIS Center, Department of Economies, University of Maryland, College Park also show that "(*a*) in hypothetical situations women are less likely to condone corruption; (*b*) women managers are less involved in bribery; and (*c*) economies which have greater representation of women in government or in market work have lower levels of corruption. Based on the evidence, taken together, the experts believed that, at least in the short or medium term, increased presence of women in public life will reduce levels of corruption"<sup>7</sup>.

It is of primary importance for APEC member economies to consider these different effects, issues and challenges when men and women interface with corruption in the light of data and studies which are conducted by experts or commissioned by international bodies mentioned. Policies should be in place to ensure that women, who represent half of the population, are also engaged and empowered in anti-corruption strategies.

With reference to the results of the Pre-Symposium Stocktaking exercise<sup>8</sup>, it has been established that not all APEC member economies share a common outlook on gender issues in their anticorruption initiatives. For instance, most (76.47%) economies regard sextortion/ sexual violence as dissociated from any corrupt element where sex is not regarded the currency of bribery. In approximately half of economies' (52.94%), collection of sex disaggregated data (SDD), as it relates to corruption, are somewhat lacking. Still some economies (23.53%) do not have gender sensitive training for their law enforcement bodies or others (64.70%) may be lacking in women's representation in decision-making positions including in anti-corruption bodies, ministries and law enforcement agencies, as referenced in Annex A.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> ibid Framework for the Integration of Women in APEC (1999) p.2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Metz-Rolshausen.B and Cordes. A (2016), Women's Role in Fighting Corruption, Alliance for Integrity Compliance Bulletin Special Edition 03, UNDP-Huairo Commission. Can be accessed from:

https://www.allianceforintegrity.org/wAssets/docs/publications/Compliance-Bulletin/AfIn\_ComplianceBulletin\_03.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Swamy.A, Knack.S, *et al* (2000): Gender and Corruption. Department of Economics, Williams College, Williamstown, U.S.A (The World Bank).Can be accessed from: https://web.williams.edu/Economics/wp/Swamy\_gender.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See Appendix A

As a way forward, the objective of this project is thus to take stock of the above findings in order to translate to the two fora, namely, the PPWE and ACTWG, tangible policy recommendations which would enable or assist economies to integrate gender mainstreaming in their anti-corruption initiatives. Ultimately, the policy recommendations are also intended to reduce the gaps identified by the stocktaking exercise in the implementation of gender mainstreaming among the economies.

### 2.0. PROCESSES AND METHODOLOGY OF POLICY RECOMMENDATION

The drafting process of the policy recommendations involved the following steps:

First, by taking stock of APEC economies' existing efforts to integrate gender in anti-corruption initiatives as follows:

- i. collating the information from the Stocktaking survey responses which were gathered before the Symposium<sup>9</sup>;
- ii. identifying the enabling mechanisms or entry points (intervention), as explored during the Symposium, to realize each policy recommendation on gender mainstreaming and women empowerment in the context of fighting corruption<sup>10</sup>
- iii. conducting desk research to substantiate certain initiatives on gender mainstreaming indicated by economies in their responses to the Stocktaking survey. This process has assisted this publication by verifying and showcasing examples of implementation among the APEC member economies<sup>11</sup>.

Secondly, by establishing a correlation between the perspectives of APEC economies in (i) and (ii) above with the views and recommendations of international organizations contributed by UN Women, UNODC and TI (Berlin)<sup>12</sup>.

The combined outcomes of the above-mentioned processes are articulated below as the eight key policy recommendations for the purview and consideration of ACTWG and /or their individual APEC economies' future gender -based anti-corruption strategies and plans.

Each policy recommendation will include a subheading under (i) views of syndicate participants to be considered; and (ii) examples of implementation by APEC economies.

ibid Appendix A.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> See Appendix D. It is to be noted that the enabling mechanisms are merely suggestions for policy makers (member economies) and are by no means exhaustive as any one enabling mechanism may interrelate with more than one policy recommendation. <sup>1</sup> See Appendix B.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See publication on Summary Report: Symposium on Gender Mainstreaming and Women Empowerment to Fight Corruption, Putrajaya, Malaysia 11-12 February 2020 from pg.10-12. A collaboration on APEC Anti-Corruption and Transparency Experts Working Group (ACTWG) with Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy (PPWE) Project ACT 01 2019 (MACC 2020). Can be accessed via: http://mddb.apec.org/Documents/2020/ACT/SYM1/20\_act\_sym1\_summary.pdf.

### 3.0. KEY POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS ON GENDER MAINSTREAMING AND WOMEN EMPOWERMENT TO FIGHT CORRUPTION

#### 3.1. RECOMMENDATION 1:

Member economies are encouraged to introduce gender mainstreaming principles in their anti-corruption policies, plans, programmes and activities

#### 3.1.1. Enabling Mechanism

An enabling mechanism under recommendation 1 is Institutionalization of Gender Mainstreaming.

#### 3.1.2. Views of syndicate participants to be considered:

- a. The need for a more effective prevention and educational strategic implementation plan;
- b. Recommend the inclusion of greater participation by women in drafting anti-corruption legislation;
- c. Incorporate gender experts in designing anticorruption policies, plans, programmes, and activities to ensure gender considerations are taken into account;
- d. Any draft policy should be categorized under the PPWE Pillars of "Capital Market & Asset, Skills Capacity Building & Health, Leadership, Innovation and Technology," as applicable;
- e. Have a monitoring aspect in place to ensure the effectiveness of any gender mainstreaming policy; and
- f. Any recommendations made are for general awareness as an initial motion on gender mainstreaming and women empowerment among APEC economies.

#### 3.1.3. Examples of institutionalization of gender mainstreaming:

- a. Women's Commission of Korea was setup in November 2001 and the commission strives to eradicate all forms of violence against women including prostitution and serve as a centre in protecting women's human rights;
- b. The Ombudsman's Gender Information Desk (GID)<sup>13</sup> and Network of Advocates was launched by The Republic of the Philippines on 25 November 2015. The GID is a facility for promoting women empowerment and gender equality and for providing assistance in a gender-responsive manner to individuals dealing with incidents involving abuse, discrimination, and violence against women and children<sup>14</sup>; and
- c. Malaysia offers its The National Anti-Corruption Plan (NACP) as an example of a progressive agenda, which includes a recommendation to have a dedicated section or plan on women's role in combating corruption.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Northern Mindanao Ombudsman opens gender desk. Accessed from: https://www.sunstar.com.ph/article/112129 <sup>14</sup> Gender and Development Focal Point System (GFPS) 2015 Accomplishments and Milestones. Can be accessed via: https://www.ombudsman.gov.ph/GAD/Gallery/2015%20GAD%20Activities.pdf

#### 3.2. RECOMMENDATION 2:

Member economies are encouraged to review anti-corruption legislation or regulation as they relate to sex as the currency of a bribe

#### 3.2.1. Enabling Mechanism

An enabling mechanism under recommendation 2 is Criminalizing Sextortion.

#### **3.2.2.** Views of syndicate participants to be considered:

- a. Revisit existing anti-corruption legislation to examine if and how sextortion should be defined and addressed within the context of each member economy;
- b. Consider including gender-based violence as a major issue of concern into the recommendation, especially given that women are often hampered from obtaining justice within their domestic legal systems due to bribery and other hindrances;
- c. It is vital to have public awareness especially when dealing or talking about sextortion, while bearing in mind the cultures and norms of the economies. NGOs should play an important role in engaging with society in raising awareness on sextortion issues, and not depend solely on a Member economy's initiatives; and
- d. Review anti-corruption legislation to explicitly criminalize incidences of sextortion (*where sexual favours*) are used as a corruption currency.

#### 3.2.3. Examples of criminalization of sextortion include as follows:

- a. The Canadian Non-Consensual Distribution of Intimate Images offence, & Extortion offence-Criminal Code passed a criminal offence under section 162.1 (1) of the Criminal Code. The government's goal under Bill C-13 was to protect Canadians from online crimes such as digital violence, including cyberbullying and sextortion scams; and
- b. The Peruvian Legislative Decree No 1410 (Article 176C-B criminal code) incorporates the offence of sexual harassment, sexual blackmail and dissemination of audio-visual or audio material with sexual content into the Criminal Code and modifying the procedure for punishing sexual harassment.

#### 3.3. RECOMMENDATION 3:

Member economies are encouraged to establish partnerships or collaborate with women-led organizations in preventing and fighting corruption

#### 3.3.1. Enabling Mechanism

An enabling mechanism under recommendation 3 is Grassroots Women Empowerment.

#### 3.3.2. View of syndicate participants to be considered:

a. Highlight the role of the Policy Partnership Women and the Economy (PPWE) in reference to politics, women and culture and impacts on women's economic participation in relationship to bribery;

- b. Women also should be given the appropriate platform to access the relevant information necessary to increase access to their civic and legal rights;
- c. Proposed to establish partnership or collaborate with civil society groups in fighting corruption; and
- d. Apply a bottom-up approach whereby economies should hold Town Hall Meetings (also known as Stakeholders Meetings) which involve NGOs, private sector, and usage of online media or electronic mechanisms to propagate it.

#### 3.3.3. Examples of empowerment of women or grassroots women organizations:

- a. The "I am a Woman against Corruption" (SPAK) organization is social movement based in Indonesia. SPAK acts as a bridge between institutions and civil society in relation to enhancing the role of women as agents of change in the fight against corruption; and
- b. In Malaysia, the "Gerakan Anti-Rasuah Wanita" (G-WAR) initiative of the MACC is created to bring women to join force as they will be the prime mover in birthing a culture that hates & rejects corruption. The establishment is in line with the third core strategy of the MACC's Strategic Plan 2017-2020 which advocates "enculturation of abhorrence towards corruption".

#### 3.4. RECOMMENDATION 4:

Member economies are invited to consider that existing and new complaint mechanisms to report corruption are gender-sensitive

#### 3.4.1. Enabling Mechanism

An enabling mechanism under recommendation 4 is Gender- Sensitive Anti-Corruption Reporting Framework.

#### 3.4.2. Views of syndicate participants to be considered:

- a. Women should have equal access to justice as men, be it formal or informal. The justice system should be able to protect women by educating them about their rights. It must be able to reach rural and remote areas;
- b. To develop a mechanism / partnership that enables women to access and report corruption;
- c. To encourage gender -sensitive complaints mechanism, Standard Operating Procedure in the Justice System is encouraged to be established to raise awareness of the complaints mechanism (functional and availability of the complaint mechanism);
- d. To review and enhance whistle blower protection measures to support women's ability to report corruption;
- e. The member economies should see that corruption is corruption regardless of gender, but a specific section on corruption's impact on gender may or could be introduced in certain legislation or regulation, which covers ways to lodge complaints/reports and outlines protections given, could include any gender-specific aspects to handling whistle-blower complaints from women; and
- f. Raised the issue of under-reporting and the need for a protection programme for complainants.

#### 3.4.3. Examples of Gender- Sensitive Anti- Corruption Reporting Framework:

- a. The Ministry of the Interior (Peru) created the "Emergency Centres For Women Inside Police Stations (CEM- *Centro de Emergencia Mujer en Comisarias*)" where women can file a complaint and receive legal, psychological and social assistance in the same place. Police stations provide services such as the reception, registration, and investigation of complaints presented by women. They are also responsible for implementing protection measures ordered by a judge; and
- b. In Korea, gender-related complaint counsellors handle complaints of sexual harassment in the workplace.

#### 3.5. RECOMMENDATION 5:

Member economies are encouraged to collect Sex Disaggregated Data (SDD) for strategizing anti-corruption and related policies and plans

#### 3.5.5. Enabling Mechanism

An enabling mechanism under recommendation 5 is SDD or Gender Disaggregated Data (GDD) Collection and Analysis Framework.

#### 3.5.1. Views of syndicate participants to be considered:

- a. Consider gathering and aggregating data on sextortion according to demographics;
- b. Consider creating public data on sextortion to be displayed on the anti-corruption or related agency's web portal;
- c. Economies are highly encouraged to tabulate information into Sex Disaggregated Data (SDD), which should be accessible and transparent to all, and include data on sextortion.
  By establishing and tabulating SDD, the anti-corruption and relevant agencies will be able to focus on how to tackle sextortion in corruption, and ways to overcome it;
- d. A proposal was offered to create shared resources on sextortion data, to include designing, implementing and evaluating data processing and sharing on sextortion and SDD; and
- e. To consider collecting Anti-Corruption Sex-Disaggregated Data (GDD) for establishing anti-corruption policies and plans.

#### 3.5.2. Examples of SDD or GDD Collection and Analysis Framework:

Note: The following member economies indicated that they have SDD data collection on corruption-related criminal offenses:

- a. Chile on extortion/sextortion, bribery/ nepotism/ parochialism/ patronage/ cronyism, influence peddling, abuse of power, embezzlement, revolving door, and state capture;
- b. Republic of Korea on bribery, abuse of power and embezzlement;
- c. Malaysia on extortion/sextortion and bribery;
- d. Papua New Guinea on extortion/sextortion, bribery/nepotism/parochialism/patronage/ cronyism, and abuse of power;
- e. Peru on extortion/sextortion, and bribery;

- f. Chinese Taipei on bribery; and
- g. Viet Nam on bribery and embezzlement.

#### 3.6. RECOMMENDATION 6:

Member economies are invited to pursue policies on promoting women's participation in decision–making positions in public and private sectors, in support of research that correlates gender diversity with reduced corruption

#### 3.6.1. Enabling Mechanism

An enabling mechanism under recommendation 6 is Gender Equality in Recruitment.

#### 3.6.2. Views of syndicate participants to be considered:

- a. Consider increasing the percentage of women participating in government and public sector and benchmarking it with the worldwide policy to achieve the proposed and agreed upon percentage participation target;
- b. Consider reviewing policies on gender balance at all levels of positions in public and private sector;
- c. Hire more women officers in law enforcement agencies;
- d. To enhance existing legal aid programs to address women's needs; and
- e. Member economies are encouraged to include and reinforce women's representation in decision-making positions and policies at all levels in government, including the legislative and judicial systems, as both a means to curb corruption and promote gender equality. In addition, this should be expanded to the private sector and non-traditional sectors.

#### 3.6.3. Examples of Gender Equality in Recruitment:

- a. The Australian Public Service Gender Equality Strategy 2016-2019 under the Australian Public Service Commission has a gender diversity target of women (women as heads of ministry/department/agency/body) holding 50% of government board positions. As of 30 June 2018, women hold 45.8% of board positions;
- b. The Hong Kong, China's Labour & Welfare Bureau (Gender Focal Point) promotes gender mainstreaming in policy and programme formulation process;
- c. Meanwhile in Mexico, the state traffic police force was made entirely female<sup>15</sup> as a new approach to fight corruption; authorities have hired hundreds of women and put them in charge of issuing all traffic violations. In June 2003, the Mexican Customs Service announced that its new force of anti-corruption officers on land and sea borders would be entirely female as part of efforts to feminize notoriously corrupt public agencies; and
- d. All- women traffic enforcement officers in Peru.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> https://www.npr.org/2013/09/28/226903227/mexican-state-s-anti-corruption-plan-hire-women-traffic-cops

#### 3.7. RECOMMENDATION 7:

Member economies are invited to consider training anti-corruption officers, as applicable, on gender responsiveness and gender sensitivity

#### 3.7.1. Enabling Mechanism

An enabling mechanism under recommendation 7 is Gender Sensitive Training.

#### 3.7.2. Views of syndicate participants to be considered:

- a. Consider training on gender responsiveness and gender sensitivity across government agencies, including the judiciary. Make similar resources available to other organizations to include NGOs and private sector where appropriate; and
- b. To provide training to any enforcement agency officers on gender responsiveness and gender sensitivity in public or private sector.

#### 3.7.3. Examples of Gender Sensitive Training:

- a. In Korea, the head of public organizations is required to provide 4-hour training sessions in 4 areas of violence including sexual harassment, sexual violence, domestic violence and commercial sex to all employees every year;
- b. The Public Prosecution Service in Peru, trains its officials (at the School of the Public Prosecution Service) through specialized courses, diplomas and workshops that are permanently offered to prosecutors at all levels, forensic doctors, forensic psychologists on women's rights and gender in order to ensure the application of domestic and international standards in the care of users, the receipt of complaints, the conduct of investigations and the gathering of evidence of these crimes in an appropriate manner;
- c. Chinese Taipei set up the Gender Awareness Training Resources Integration Platform to increase the personnel's gender awareness and sensitivity in the public sectors. Courses under the topic "Gender Equality Policy Guidelines-Gender on Safety & Justice" was provided to their staff in Agency Against Corruption (AAC). The purpose was to establish a mechanism for enacting gender equality policy in judicial system, to examine & oversee the establishment of a conducive environment for gender equality;
- d. All Department of Justice officials of Canada including those working on legal services, litigation, legislative drafting, policy and program development, international agreements or programs, research, communications, evaluation, management or other areas, are to apply GBA+ and ensure that their work consider and reflect the diverse needs of different groups of people. To enable this, GBA+ training is now mandatory for all Department of Justice officials; and
- e. The Department of Justice (DOJ) of United States has mandatory training on prohibition of discrimination & harassment, two critical issues in fostering sensitivity. DOJ's Office on Violence Against Women has funded a project providing resources on responding to workplace sexual assault and harassment and domestic violence<sup>16</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> https://www.workplacesrespond.org

#### 3.8. RECOMMENDATION 8:

Member economies are encouraged to consider Gender Responsive Budgeting as a potential means of promoting gender equality in anti-corruption initiatives

#### 3.8.1. Enabling Mechanism

An enabling mechanism under recommendation 8 is Gender Responsive Budgeting.

#### **3.8.2.** Views of syndicate participants to be considered:

- a. Consider adopting Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) as a mechanism to potentially promote gender equality, accountability and transparency among economies; and
- b. Consider using GRB as a potential tool for making anti-corruption efforts more impactful and accessible.

#### 3.8.3. Examples of Gender Responsive Budgeting<sup>17</sup>:

- a. Balancing the Future: Australian Public Service Gender Equality Strategy 2016-2019 is dedicated to providing policy advice and guidance to all Australian Public Service (APS) agencies on gender equality;
- b. The Canadian GBA+ Action Plan is an intersectional analytical process for examining how various intersecting identity factors impact the effectiveness of government initiatives. It involves examining disaggregated data and research, and considering social, economic, and cultural conditions and norms;
- c. Korean Gender Responsive Budgeting is based on Article 16 of the Framework Act on Gender Equality and Article 16 Paragraph.5 of the National Finance Act. The Act requires that state and local governments analyse the impact of budget on women and men and implement gender responsive budgeting which reflects such impact in the financial operation of the government;
- d. Gender and Development (GAD) Budget policy (1999) from The Republic of the Philippines has evolved from a series of legislative mandates, including the Magna Carta of Women (1999) which requires all government agencies to allocate at least five percent of their budgets to address gender issues with the intention for the five per cent to influence the remaining 95 per cent; and
- e. Gender Equality Policy Guidelines (Act of Gender Equality in Employment, Gender Equity Education Act and Enforcement Act of CEDAW) in Chinese Taipei are regulations which promote gender equality.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> The United States notes a reporting error in the survey results contained in Appendix A with respect to Question 4 and would like to clarify that the United States has not adopted gender responsive budgeting. The recently enacted Women's Entrepreneurship and Economic Empowerment Act of 2018 calls on the US Agency for International Development (USAID) to ensure its strategies, projects, and activities are shaped by a gender analysis. It also calls for the integration of gender equality and female empowerment throughout USAID's program cycle, including strategic planning, project design & implementation, and monitoring & evaluation.

### 4.0. CONCLUSION AND THE WAY FORWARD

The policy recommendations outlined in this publication suggested policies for economies' consideration that support the implementation of gender mainstreaming and women empowerment in the fight against corruption. Taking a gender lens to combating corruption by members of the ACTWG would complement their economies' commitment and obligations under international and regional anti-corruption initiatives.

Additionally, the policies also support the objectives of the La Serena Roadmap for Women and Inclusive Growth (2019-2030) by removing barriers, such as corruption, to improve women's economic participation in APEC via its key action areas, namely:

- a. Empowering women through access to capital and markets;
- b. Strengthening women's labour force participation;
- c. Improving access of women to leadership positions in all levels of decision making;
- d. Support women's education, training and skills development and access in a changing world of work; and
- e. Advancing women's economic empowerment through data collection and analysis.

By having such policies in place, APEC economies will be able to make more prudent and efficient decisions in their plans, budgetary expenditures and usages of resources for their anti-corruption programmes and activities.

As a way forward, consideration, adoption, and implementation of such policies in an economy's anti-corruption plan, programmes, policy, and related initiatives may further reduce corruption as they heed the needs of both women and men.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- 1. APEC, 2016. Women's Economic Participation in Peru. Achieving APEC Priorities for Gender Equality.
- Andersen, Mary. 1993. 'The Concept of Mainstreaming: Experience and Change', in Mary Andersen (ed.) Focusing on Women: UNIFEM's experience with mainstreaming, pp. 1– 32. New York: UNIFEM.
- 3. Baden, Sally and Anne-Marie Goetz. 1997. 'Why Do We Need Sex When We've Got Gender?', Feminist Review 56: 3–23.
- 4. Beneria, L.Berik, G.and Floro, M., 2015.Gender, Development and Globalization: Economics as if All People Mattered. New York: Routledge
- 5. Bellemy, Kate. 2002. Gender Budgeting. Background Paper, Council of Europe's Informal Network of Experts on Gender Budgeting. www.wbg.org.uk/GBA\_Present.htm.
- 6. Budlender, Debbie and Rhonda Sharp with Kathryn Allen. 1998. How to Do a GenderSensitive Budget Analysis. London: Commonwealth Secretariat.
- 7. C, ag<sup>\*</sup>atay, Nilufer, Diane Elson and Caren Grown. 1995. 'Special Issue: Gender, Adjustment and Macroeconomics', World Development 23 (11).
- 8. Chappell, Louise. 2000. 'Interacting with the State: Feminist Strategies and Political Opportunities', International Feminist Journal of Politics 2 (2): 244–75.
- Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women: Concluding observations on the ninth periodic report of Mexico. Accessed from: https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CEDAW/Shared%20Documents/MEX/CEDAW\_C\_M EX\_CO\_9\_31059\_E.docx
- 10. Department of Justice (2019), "Policy on Gender-Based Analysis Plus".Can be accessed via: https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/abt-apd/pgbap-pacsp.html
- European Commission. 2000. Gender Equality in the European Union: Examples of Good Practices (1996–2000). D-G for Employment and Social Affairs, Unit 5: European Commission.
- 12. Esquivel, V., 2016. Power and the sustainable development goals: A feminist analysis. Gender & Development 24(1), 9-23
- 13. Goetz, Anne-Marie (ed.). 1995. 'Getting the Institutions Right for Women in Development', Special Issue IDS Bulletin 26 (3).
- 14. Hung-En Sung, 'Fairer Sex or Fairer System? Gender and Corruption Revisited', Social Forces, Vol. 82, No. 2 (2003).

- 15. Implementation Report 2015 Transparency International Secretariat.Accessed from:https://www.transparency.org/files/content/ourorganisation/2015\_TI-S\_ImplementationReport\_EN.pdf
- Joyce, Philip. 2003. Linking Performance and Budgeting: Opportunities in the Federal Budget Process. Managing for Performance and Results Series. Washington, DC: IBM Center for the Business of Government.
- 17. Karam, Azza (ed.). 1998. Women in Parliament: Beyond Numbers. Stockholm: International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance.
- 18. Kabeer, N., Natali, L., 2013. Gender Equality and Economic Growth: Is there a Win-Win? IDS WORKING PAPER No 417.
- 19. Mazey, Sonia. 2000. 'Introduction: Integrating Gender Intellectual and "Real World" Mainstreaming', Journal of European Public Policy 7 (3): 333–45.
- 20. Moss-Kanter, Rosalind. 1993. Men and Women of the Corporation (2nd edn). New York: Basic Books.
- 21. National Public Service Gender Equity and Social Inclusion Policy Implementation PNG UPDATE .Accessed from:http://devpolicy.org/Events/2015/2015-PNG-Update/ Presentations/Day-1/Gender\_Davies.pdf
- 22. Offices of Institutional Integrity in Peru Implementing The Integrity System. Accessed from: <u>https://www.oecd.org/gov/ethics/offices-of-institutional-integrity-peru.pdf</u>
- 23. Pollack, Mark A. and Emilie Hafner-Burton. 2000. 'Mainstreaming Gender in the European Union', Harvard Jean Monnet Working Paper No. 2. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Law School.
- 24. Razavi, Shahar and Carol Miller. 1995. Gender Mainstreaming: A Study of Efforts by the UNDP, the World Bank and the ILO to Institutionalize Gender Issues. Geneva: United Nations Research Institute for Social Development Occasional Paper No. 4.
- Sen, Gita. 2000. 'Gender Mainstreaming in Finance Ministeries', World Development 28 (7): 1379–90.
- 26. Swamy, A., St. Knack, Y. Lee and O. Azfar (1999), "Gender and Corruption." Draft Paper, IRIS Center, University of Maryland, July.
- 27. True, Jacqui and Michael Mintrom. 2001. 'Transnational Networks and Policy Diffusion: The Case of Gender Mainstreaming', International Studies Quarterly 45 (1): 29–59.
- 28. Transparency International, '2013 Global Corruption Barometer' (Berlin, Germany: Transparency International, 2013), http://www.transparency.org/gcb2013
- 29. UNDP, 2016. Human Development Report Human Development for Everyone. New York.

- UNDOC(2018), "Strengthening Anti-Corruption Institutions in Indonesia". Accessed via: https:// www. unodc. org/ documents/ evaluation/Independent\_Project\_Evaluations/ 2018/INDA03\_Final\_Independent\_Project\_Evaluation\_Report\_April\_2018.pdf.
- 31. United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (2014). Empowering Women Economically: Illustrative Case Studies from Asia. Bangkok: ESCAP; UN Women Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (2016). Gender Responsive Budgeting in the Asia-Pacific Region: A Status Report. Bangkok: UN Women.
- 32. Vivi Alatas et al, 'Gender, Culture, and Corruption: Insights from an Experimental Analysis', Southern Economic Journal, Vol. 75, No. 3 (2009).
- 33. Woodward, Alison E. 2001. 'Gender Mainstreaming in European Policy: Innovation or Deception?', paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Political Science Association, San Francisco, September.
- 34. World Bank, 2006. Gender Equality as Smart Economics: A World Bank Group Gender Action Plan 2007 2010.

## APPENDIX A

## STOCKTAKING SURVEY REPORT



#### ACT 01 2019 – SYMPOSIUM ON GENDER MAINSTREAMING AND WOMEN EMPOWERMENT TO FIGHT CORRUPTION

#### STOCKTAKING SURVEY REPORT

#### APEC ANTI-CORRUPTION AND TRANSPARENCY EXPERTS WORKING GROUP

FEBRUARY 2020

APEC PROJECT

Produced by

**Chuah Chang Man** 

Project Contractor

AND

#### Policy, Planning and Research Division

Malaysian Anti-Corruption Commission Putrajaya, Malaysia Email: actwg2020macc@gmail.com

DISCLAIMER: This stocktaking survey report is prepared by the Malaysian Anti-Corruption Commission (MACC) solely for the purpose of preparation work conjunction with the symposium. The report and its findings are not intended to and should not be used or relied upon by any economy without prior consent of the APEC Secretariat. It is also important to note that the information contained in the report thereof does not imply benchmarking or performance of any APEC member economy.

#### INTRODUCTION

In Chile, 2004, the APEC Leaders acknowledged that corruption is a serious threat to sustainable economic growth, good governance, market integrity and enhanced trade and investment<sup>18</sup>. Women are particularly affected by corruption and the experience and impact of corruption on women can be different from those faced by men. This is in addition to the unfortunate fact that women generally earn lower incomes and have lower ratio of representation in public and private sector leadership. UNDP and other international organizations have identified the areas where women frequently encounter corruption, namely (a) in accessing basic services, markets and credit; (b) while engaging in electoral politics; (c) in situations where women' rights are violated (e.g., trafficking and sexual extortion); and (d) negligence and mismanagement<sup>19</sup>.

Women may also face indirect impacts of corruption when funding is corruptly diverted from social investment such as enhancing health care services, for example, into less necessary projects or the pockets of corrupt actors.

The APEC Women and The Economy Dashboard 2019 indicated that political leadership is still low in terms of women participation over the years, with both the proportion of seats held by women in parliaments and the measure on the parity with at the highest levels of political decision-making peaking at 20-22 percent for the period 2008-2018. Whereas APEC 2014 Women in the Economy Forum Statements stated that all APEC economies are encouraged to achieve goals related to women's representation in leadership and decision- making roles and positions in both public and private sectors.

To address this matter, Malaysia hosted a Symposium on Gender Mainstreaming and Women Empowerment to Fight Corruption which was held in the margin of the first Senior Officials' Meeting (SOM1) on 11-12 February 2020, at Putrajaya, Malaysia. The symposium was funded by APEC and focused on the gendered impact and experience of corruption with the objective of strengthening women's engagement through gender mainstreaming in economic, political and social spheres. This project intends to identify linkages between gender and corruption and to explore how gendered experiences in control over resources, development benefits and decision making can be applied to fight corruption. These lessons can be applied to other APEC anti-corruption initiatives. This project was a collaboration between two fora: Anti-Corruption and Transparency Experts Working Group (ACTWG) and Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy (PPWE).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> APEC Leaders' Declaration, Santiago, Chile, 20 November 2004

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> UNDP, Seeing Beyond The State: Grassroots Women's Perspectives on Corruption and Anti-Corruption. 2012, p.13, https://issuu.com/undpasiapacific/docs/grassroots\_women\_and\_anti-corruption

#### METHODOLOGY

Prior to the symposium, between 9 October and 31 October 2019, a stocktaking survey, both quantitative and qualitative, was conducted by the Malaysian Anti-Corruption Commission (MACC). The result of the stocktaking survey, namely "Stocktaking Survey Report" will be one of the outputs under this project. The survey was designed not only to gauge the status of the APEC economies' implementation of gender mainstreaming and women empowerment initiatives to fight corruption but also to provide feedback and valuable inputs for the preparation of the contents and the identification of speakers for the symposium.

The stocktaking survey was carried out using a set of questionnaire<sup>20</sup> comprising a total 14 questions which covered various aspects of gender mainstreaming in anti-corruption policies, programmes and legislation as well as women's participation in anti-corruption initiatives. The questionnaire was circulated among the 21 member economies of ACTWG. The response rate of this stocktaking survey by 17 member economies or 81% had exceeded the targeted response rate of 50%. The 17 member economies that responded were as follows:

- a. Australia- Attorney's General Department
- b. Canada- Global Affairs Canada (GAC)
- c. Chile- Public Prosecutor's Office of Chile
- d. Hong Kong, China- Independent Commission Against Corruption (ICAC)
- e. Indonesia- Komisi Pembanterasan Korupsi (KPK)
- f. Republic of Korea- Anti-Corruption and Civil Rights Commission (ACRC)
- g. Malaysia- Ministry of Women, Family and Community Development (KPWKM) and Malaysian Anti-Corruption Commission (MACC)
- h. New Zealand- Serious Fraud Office (SFO)
- i. Papua New Guinea- Department of Justice & Attorney General (DJAG)
- j. Peru- Secretariat of Public Integrity of the Presidency of the Council of Ministers; Ministry of Women and Vulnerable Population; Public Prosecution Service and Attorney General's Office
- k. The Republic of the Philippines- Office of the Ombudsman
- 1. The Russian Federation- Investigative Committee of the Russian Federation
- m. Singapore- Corrupt Practices Investigation Bureau (CPIB)
- n. Chinese Taipei- Agency Against Corruption, Ministry of Justice

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> See Appendix A

- o. Thailand- National Anti-Corruption Commission (NACC)
- p. The United States- U.S. Department of State
- q. Viet Nam- Government Inspectorate of Vietnam

#### SURVEY RESULTS

The results of the stocktaking survey collated showed the disparities in the implementation of gender mainstreaming into the policies, legislation and programmes among the economies of the APEC region. The gaps and challenges identified in the survey in relation to gender mainstreaming the anticorruption and transparency objectives of the ACTWG vis-à-vis the APEC Gender Inclusion Guidelines (GIG) promulgated by PPWE served as reference and guide for policy recommendations on gender mainstreaming and women empowerment to fight corruption that were formulated at the conclusion of the symposium for consideration by members of the ACTWG.

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

Question 1: Does your economy have gender mainstreaming perspective in any anti-corruption law/ policies/ initiatives?	25	Question 10: Please provide the statistics of sextortion in relation to total number of complaints received by your anti-corruption agency or law enforcement body for the period from 2014 to 2019.	34
Question 2: Does your economy have anti-corruption laws/ subsidiary legislation/ rules/ regulations which explicitly address sextortion?	26	10.1 Statistics of sextortion in Korea	35
Question 3: Does your economy's criminal justice system in relation to corruption and related offences take into account a gender responsive perspective or approach in the dispensation of justice?	27	10.2 Statistics of sextortion in Peru	36
Question 4: Does your economy adopt gender responsive budgeting?	28	10.3 Statistics of sextortion in Malaysia	37
Question 5: Does your Ministry/ Agency/ Body have officers trained on gender sensitivity?	29	Question 11: Does your Ministry/Agency/ Body develop anti- corruption policy/ initiative based on gender-analysis?	38
Question 6: Does your Ministry/ Agency/ Body have in-house gender expert(s) or specialist(s)?	30	Question 12: Does your Ministry/ Agency/ Body implement gender mainstreaming in decision-making positions?	39
Question 7: Does your Ministry/Agency/Body collect sex-disaggregated data (SDD) / gender statistics of complainant/ victim/ accused resulting from the various form of corruption for analysis?	31	Question 13: Does (Do) your anti-corruption agency (ies) and/or law enforcement body (ies) conduct any gender-balanced awareness- raising campaigns against corruption?	40
Question 8: Do your anti-corruption agencies or law enforcement bodies have gender quota on recruitment?	32	Question 14: Does (Do) your anti-corruption agency (ies) and/or law enforcement body (ies) develop and disseminate knowledge products on how corruption affects women and men differently (e.g. corruption in service delivery)?	41
Question 9: Please provide the percentages of women and men in the anti- corruption agencies or law enforcement bodies.	33	Appendix: Stock Taking Survey Questionnaire	42-47

### SURVEY RESULTS



Question 1: Does your economy have gender mainstreaming perspective in any anti-corruption law/ policies/ initiatives?

DIAGRAM 1- Gender Mainstreaming Anti-Corruption Law/Policies/Initiatives

**Finding 1**: Out of the 17 economies that responded, eight (47%) - Canada; Chile; Indonesia; Korea; Papua New Guinea; Peru; The Republic of the Philippines; and Chinese Taipei- indicated "Yes", whereas nine (53%) – Australia; Hong Kong, China; Malaysia; New Zealand; Russia; Singapore; Thailand; The United States; and Viet Nam - indicated "No".

Question 2: Does your economy have anti-corruption laws/ subsidiary legislation/ rules/ regulations which explicitly address sextortion?



**DIAGRAM 2- Sextortion Offence in Anti-Corruption Legislation** 

**Finding 2**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, four (23.52%) – Canada; Papua New Guinea; Peru; and The Republic of the Philippines - indicated "Yes", whereas 13 (76.47%) – Australia; Chile; Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; Korea; Malaysia; New Zealand; Russia; Singapore; Chinese Taipei; Thailand; United States; and Viet Nam - indicated "No".

Question 3: Does your economy's criminal justice system in relation to corruption and related offences take into account a gender responsive perspective or approach in the dispensation of justice?



**DIAGRAM 3-** Gender responsive dispensation of criminal justice in relation to corruption and related offences.

**Finding 3**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, three (11.80%) – Canada; Malaysia; and Peru - indicated "Yes", while 13 (82.40%) – Australia; Chile; Hong Kong ,China; Indonesia; Korea; New Zealand; Papua New Guinea; Russia; Singapore; Chinese Taipei; Thailand; United States; and Viet Nam - indicated "No", whereas one (5.80%) from The Republic of the Philippines responded with "No Answer".

**Question 4: Does your economy adopt gender responsive budgeting?** 



#### DIAGRAM 4- Gender responsive budgeting.

**Finding 4**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, eight (47.10%) – Canada; Korea; Malaysia; Papua New Guinea; The Republic of the Philippines; Singapore; Chinese Taipei; and United States<sup>21</sup> - indicated "Yes" while eight (47.10%) – Australia; Chile; Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; New Zealand; Peru; Russia; and Thailand - indicated "No", whereas one (5.80%) from Viet Nam responded with "No Answer".

\*The Korean gender responsive budgeting is based on the Article 16 of the Framework Act on Gender Equality and Art.16. Para 5 of the National Finance Act of Korea which requires the state and local government to analyse the impact of budget on women and men and implement gender responsive budgeting that is reflective in the financial operation of the government.

\*In the Republic of the Philippines, domestic government agencies are mandated to attribute and /or allocate at least 5% of their General Appropriations Act to gender and development.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> The United States notes a reporting error in the survey results contained in Appendix A with respect to Question 4 and would like to clarify that the United States has not adopted gender responsive budgeting. The recently enacted Women's Entrepreneurship and Economic Empowerment Act of 2018 calls on the US Agency for International Development (USAID) to ensure its strategies, projects, and activities are shaped by a gender analysis. It also calls for the integration of gender equality and female empowerment throughout USAID's program cycle, including strategic planning, project design & implementation, and monitoring & evaluation.



Question 5: Does your Ministry/ Agency/ Body have officers trained on gender sensitivity?

**DIAGRAM 5**- Officers trained on gender sensitivity.

**Finding 5**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, 11 (64.71%) –Australia; Canada; Chile; Hong Kong, China; Korea; Malaysia; Papua New Guinea; Peru; The Republic of the Philippines; Chinese Taipei; and United States, - indicated "Yes", while four (23.53%) – Indonesia; New Zealand; Russia; and Thailand - indicated "No", whereas two (11.76%) from Viet Nam; and Singapore responded with "No Answer".

\*In Korea, head of public organizations are required to provide 4-hour training sessions in four areas of violence including sexual harassment, sexual violence, domestic violence and commercial sex to all employees every year.

\* Gender Based Analysis Plus (GBA +) is mandatory training for all Department of Justice officials in Canada.



Question 6: Does your Ministry/ Agency/ Body have in-house gender expert(s) or specialist(s)?

DIAGRAM 6- Ministry/ Agency/ Body with in-house gender expert(s) /specialist(s)

**Finding 6**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, eight (47.06%) –Australia; Canada; Chile; Korea; Malaysia; Papua New Guinea; Peru; and United States - indicated "Yes" while seven (41.18%) Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; New Zealand; The Republic of the Philippines; Russia; Chinese Taipei; and Thailand - indicated "No", whereas two (11.76%) from Viet Nam and Singapore responded with "No Answer".

\*In Canada, most federal government departments have in- house gender analysis expert.

\*The Australian Public Service Commission (APSC) has a team dedicated to provide police advice and guidance to APS agencies on gender equality.

Question 7: Does your Ministry/Agency/Body collect sex-disaggregated data (SDD) / gender statistics of complainant/ victim/ accused resulting from the various form of corruption for analysis?



DIAGRAM 7- Collection of sex-disaggregated data (SDD) / gender statistics of complainant/ victim/ accused

**Finding 7**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, seven (41.18%) – Chile; Korea; Malaysia; Papua New Guinea; Peru; Chinese Taipei; and Viet Nam - indicated "Yes", while nine (52.94%) – Australia; Canada; Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; New Zealand; The Republic of the Philippines; Russia; Thailand; and United States - indicated "No", whereas one (5.88%) from Singapore responded with "No Answer".



Question 8: Do your anti-corruption agencies or law enforcement bodies have gender quota on recruitment?

#### **DIAGRAM 8- Gender quota in recruitment process**

**Finding 8**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, one (5.88%) – Korea - indicated "Yes", while 15 (88.24%) – Australia; Canada; Chile; Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; Malaysia; New Zealand; Papua New Guinea; Peru; The Republic of the Philippines; Russia; Singapore; Chinese Taipei; Thailand; and United States - indicated "No", whereas one (5.88%) from Viet Nam responded with "No Answer".




DIAGRAM 9- Percentages of women and men within anti-corruption agencies or law enforcement bodies

**Finding 9**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, 13 — Australia; Canada; Chile; Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; Korea; Malaysia; New Zealand; Peru; The Republic of the Philippines; Russia; Chinese Taipei; and Thailand – indicated that the proportion of each gender employed in their anti-corruption agencies/law enforcement bodies was on the average 41.89% for women and 58.10% for men, whereas four economies from Papua New Guinea; Singapore; United States; and Viet Nam responded with "No Answer".

Question 10: Please provide the statistics of sextortion in relation to total number of complaints received by your anti-corruption agency or law enforcement body for the period from 2014 to 2019.



DIAGRAM 10- Statistics of sextortion in relation to total number of complaints received

**Finding 10**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, three (17.65%) — Korea; Malaysia; and Peru - indicated "Yes" while eight (47.05%) – Australia; Chile; Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; New Zealand; Papua New Guinea; Russia; and Chinese Taipei indicated "No", whereas six (35.29%) from Canada; The Republic of the Philippines; Singapore; Thailand; United States; and Viet Nam responded with "No Answer".





DIAGRAM 10.1- Korean statistics of sextortion in relation to total number of complaints received





DIAGRAM 10.2- Peru's statistics of sextortion in relation to total number of complaints received







Question 11: Does your Ministry/Agency/ Body develop anti-corruption policy/ initiative based on gender-analysis?



#### DIAGRAM 11- Development of anti-corruption policy/ initiative based on gender-analysis

**Finding 11**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, five (29.41%) — Canada; Korea; Papua New Guinea; Peru; and The Republic of the Philippines - indicated "Yes", while 11 (64.70%) – Australia; Chile; Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; Malaysia; New Zealand; Russia; Chinese Taipei; Thailand; United States; and Viet Nam indicated "No", whereas one (5.88%) from Singapore responded with "No Answer".

Question 12: Does your Ministry/ Agency/ Body implement gender mainstreaming in decision-making positions?



#### DIAGRAM 12- Implementation of gender mainstreaming in decision-making positions

**Finding 12**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, six (35.29%) — Australia; Canada; Korea; Malaysia; Peru; and The Republic of the Philippines - indicated "Yes", while 11 (64.70%) – Chile; Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; New Zealand; Papua New Guinea; Russia; Singapore; Chinese Taipei; Thailand; United States; and Viet Nam indicated "No".

\*In Australia, the Office for Women has a gender diversity target set of women holding 50% of government board positions.

\*In Peru, Law No.30966 states that in the next elections, the list of candidates for Congress must include 40% of women or men, place interspersed.

Question 13: Does (Do) your anti-corruption agency (ies) and/or law enforcement body (ies) conduct any gender-balanced awareness-raising campaigns against corruption?



DIAGRAM 13- Gender-balanced awareness-raising campaigns against corruption organized

**Finding 13**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, five (29.42%) — Australia, Malaysia; Papua New Guinea; Peru; and The Republic of the Philippines; - indicated "Yes", while 10 (58.82%) – Chile; Hong Kong, China; Indonesia; Korea; New Zealand; Russia; Chinese Taipei; Thailand; United States; and Viet Nam indicated "No", whereas two (11.76%) from Canada; and Singapore responded with "No Answer".

Question 14: Does (Do) your anti-corruption agency (ies) and/or law enforcement body (ies) develop and disseminate knowledge products on how corruption affects women and men differently (e.g. corruption in service delivery)?



#### DIAGRAM 14- Development and dissemination of knowledge products on effects of corruption towards women and men

**Finding 14**- Out of the 17 economies that responded, three (17.65%) — Australia; Indonesia; and The Republic of the Philippines - indicated "Yes", while 11 (64.70%) – Chile; Hong Kong, China; Korea; Malaysia; New Zealand; Papua New Guinea; Peru; Russia; Chinese Taipei; Thailand; and United States, indicated "No", whereas, three (17.65%) from Canada; Singapore; and Viet Nam responded with "No Answer".

## PRE-SYMPOSIUM SURVEY (STOCK TAKING)

# ACT 01 2019 – SYMPOSIUM ON GENDER MAINSTREAMING AND WOMEN EMPOWERMENT TO FIGHT CORRUPTION

#### Questionnaire

1. Does your economy have **gender mainstreaming**<sup>22</sup> perspective in any **anti-corruption** law/ policies/ initiatives?

#### a. Yes/ No

b. If yes, please cite relevant gender- related **anti-corruption** law/ policies/ initiatives.

Title Of Law/ Policy/ Initiative	Brief Description	Year Implemented

2. Does your economy have **anti-corruption** laws/ subsidiary legislation/ rules/ regulations which explicitly address **sextortion**<sup>23</sup>?

#### a. Yes/ No

b. If yes, please cite the relevant **anti-corruption** laws/ subsidiary legislation/ rules/ regulations and the names of the enforcement/regulatory/oversight bodies responsible for the implementation of such legislation.

Title of Law/subsidiary	Section/ Article	Year Implemented	Enforcement/
legislation/rules/regulations			Regulatory/ Oversight
			bodies

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> The process of ensuring that women and men have equal access and control over resources, development benefits and decision-making, at all stages of the development process and in all government projects, programs and policy. [APEC Gender Inclusion Guidelines,p.12]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> A combination of 'sex and extortion', which sex, not money, is the currency of the bribe. Defined by the Interdomestic Association of Women Judges (IAWJ), sextortion is an abuse of power involving a demand for sexual favours.

- 3. Does your economy's criminal justice system in relation to **corruption and related offences** take into account **a gender responsive**<sup>24</sup> perspective or approach in the dispensation of justice?
- a. Yes/ No
- b. If yes, please describe the relevant area(s) in the criminal justice system (e.g. enforcement/prosecution/ trials/ punishment etc.) and the gender responsiveness of each area.

Area	Brief Description

4. Does your economy adopt **gender responsive budgeting**<sup>25</sup>?

#### a. Yes/ No

b. If yes, please specify the area (s) (e.g. education, healthcare) and give a brief description of the measures taken.

Area	Brief Description

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> The consistent and systematic attention given to the differences between women and men in society with a view to addressing structural constraints to gender equality [APEC Gender Inclusion Guidelines, p.13]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> An application of gender mainstreaming in the budgetary process and restructuring revenues and expenditures in order to promote gender equality [APEC Gender Inclusion Guidelines, 13]

5. Does your Ministry/ Agency/ Body have officers trained on gender sensitivity<sup>26</sup>?

a. Yes/ No

b. If yes, please specify the area (e.g. investigation, education, prevention etc.) and the brief description of the gender sensitivity programme/ training.

Area	Brief Description

6. Does your Ministry/ Agency/ Body have in-house gender expert/s or specialist/s?

a. Yes/ No

b. If yes, please list down their designation and areas of expertise

Designation (e.g. gender and development specialist)	Area of expertise (e.g. gender analysis, gender responsive budgeting, gender based violence)

7. Does your Ministry/Agency/Body collect sex-disaggregated data (SDD)<sup>27</sup>/ gender statistics of complainant/ victim/ accused resulting from the various form of corruption for analysis?

a. Yes/ No

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> The ability to recognize gender issues and to recognize women's different perceptions and interests arising from their different social position and roles. Gender sensitivity is often used to mean the same as gender awareness. It is actually the beginning of gender awareness which is more analytical and critical. [APEC Gender Inclusion Guidelines, 13]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Data that identifies differences between the circumstances of women and men, girls and boys. Sex-disaggregated data collection is an integral part of gender analysis. [APEC Gender Inclusion Guidelines, 13]

b. If yes, please specify.

Form of corruption	Please tick ( $$ )
Extortion (Sextortion)	
Bribery	
Nepotism/ parochialism/	
patronage/ Cronyism	
Influence peddling	
Abuse of power	
Embezzlement	
Revolving door	
State capture	
Others	

- 8. Do your anti-corruption agencies or law enforcement bodies have gender quota on recruitment?
- a. Yes/ No
- b. If yes, please cite relevant legislation/policy/rules/regulation on gender quota for recruitment into your anti-corruption agencies/law enforcement bodies

Name of anti-corruption agency	Title of Law/ policy/	Brief Description (cite
or law enforcement body	rules/ regulations	relevant provision)

9. Please provide the percentages of women and men in the anti-corruption agencies or law enforcement bodies.

Agency (e.g. Police, customs,		Percentage	
immigration)	eustonis,	Men	Women

10.Please provide the statistics of **sextortion**<sup>28</sup> in relation to total number of complaints received by your anti-corruption agency or law enforcement body (ies) for the period from 2014 to 2018.

Year	Name of ACA/ Law- Enforcement Body	Complaint received	Complaint related to sextortion
2014			
2015			
2016			
2017			
2018			

Note: You may add additional table if more than 1 agency/ body involved in receiving such complaints. 11.Does your Ministry/Agency/ Body develop **anti-corruption** policy/ initiative based on gender-analysis?

a. Yes/ No

b. If yes, please list and describe the relevant **anti-corruption** policy/ initiative.

Anti-corruption policy/ initiative	Brief Description

12.Does your Economy/ Ministry/ Agency/ Body implement gender mainstreaming<sup>29</sup> in decision-making positions a. Yes/ No

b. If yes, please specify.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> A combination of 'sex and extortion', which sex, not money, is the currency of the bribe. Defined by the International Association of Women Judges (IAWJ), sextortion is an abuse of power involving a demand for sexual favours.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> The process of ensuring that women and men have equal access and control over resources, development benefits and decision-making, at all stages of the development process and in all government projects, programs and policy

Political (e.g. quota for women participation in parliament)	
Economy (e.g. quota for women board of director)	
Public service (women as heads of ministry/department/agency/body)	
Social (e.g. women right group)	

- 13. Does (Do) your anti-corruption agency (ies) and/or law enforcement body (ies) conduct any gender-balanced **awareness-raising campaigns** against corruption?
- a. Yes/ No
- b. If yes, please provide examples of implementation.

Campaigns	Description of implementation

- 14. Does (Do) your anti-corruption agency (ies) and/or law enforcement body (ies) develop and disseminate **knowledge products** on how corruption affects women and men differently (e.g. corruption in service delivery)?
- a. Yes/ No.
- b. If yes, please provide examples of implementation.

Initiative/ product	Description of implementation

# APPENDIX B

# GOOD PRACTICES OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING AND WOMEN EMPOWEREMENT IN APEC ECONOMIES

The results (quantitative) of the stocktaking survey showed that some economies have responded positively to or are in compliance with a certain set of survey questionnaire posted (see APPENDIX A). As a follow- up process, a desk research was carried out by the authors with the view to verify the said responses submitted by the economies. Our research has led us to confirm and substantiate some of the notable examples of good practices on gender mainstreaming and women empowerment in the anti-corruption initiatives which are being implemented by the economies in response to eight of the fourteen questions which are relevant to the eight policy recommendations formulated. It is to be noted that the good practices identified and cited below are by no means exhaustive to the economy mentioned but have served as references in complementing each of the policy recommendations.

#### Question 1:

Does your economy have gender mainstreaming perspective in any anticorruption law/ policies/ initiatives?

#### 1. CANADA

GOOD PRACTICE : GBA+ Action Plan- Gender Based Analysis Plus (GBA+) TARGET GROUPS: Women, men and people with other gender identities marginalized

- GBA+ Action Plan- Gender Based Analysis Plus (GBA+)<sup>30</sup> is an intersectional analytical process for examining how various intersecting identity factors impact the effectiveness of government initiatives. It involves examining disaggregated data and research, and considering social, economic, and cultural conditions and norms.
- Legislation, including anti-corruption legislation, undergoes a GBA+ analysis. The department responsible for the implementation of GBA+ has also expressly encouraged federal government departments to subject all procurement activity to GBA+.
- Under the Justice Canada Policy on Gender-Based Analysis Plus(GBA+), the Department of Justice Canada is dedicated to ensure that its activities are aligned with the Government of Canada's commitments to GBA+ and help to foster fair outcomes for diverse groups of women, men and people with other gender identities. The Justice Canada Policy on GBA+ applies to all officials and to the development of all policies, programs and other initiatives.
  - In particular, the Policy on GBA+:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Department of Justice (2019), "Policy on Gender-Based Analysis Plus".Can be accessed via: https://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/abt-apd/pgbap-pacsp.html

- i. Requires officials in all parts of the Department to follow GBA+ training, to apply GBA+ and to ensure that their work considers and reflects the diverse needs of different groups of people;
- ii. Provides guiding principles for GBA+ that it be integrated and systematic, evidencebased, and cognizant of evolving social norms;
- iii. Recommends that GBA+ be conducted throughout key stages of initiatives and that these analyses and impacts on initiatives be clearly documented; and
- iv. Sets out clear accountabilities and responsibilities for all officials. Assistant Deputy Ministers are responsible for ensuring their officials take GBA+ training and integrate GBA+ in their work.

# 2. INDONESIA

GOOD PRACTICE : Implementation of social movement called "I am a Woman against Corruption" (SPAK)

TARGET GROUPS: Women from all walks of life

- The existence of a social movement called "I am a Woman against Corruption" (SPAK). Indonesia's initiative via SPAK is to develop a movement that prevents corruption stemming from corruptive behaviour. As the movement believes that it must start from home and involve women and those who have a significant role in the family to nurture anti-corruption values. SPAK's <sup>31</sup> role in engendering anti-corruption activities has significantly impacted Indonesia in the following ways:
  - (a) SPAK acts as a bridge between institutions and civil society in relation to enhance the role of women as agents of change in the fight against corruption; and
  - (b) The SPAK approach now encompasses civil society, encouraging women in various walks of life to become "SPAK agents". There is scope for the SPAK approach to be replicated and developed across all anti-corruption institutions and in the private sector. SPAK has become a useful channel for women in civil society to cooperate with women in the civil service.

#### 3. REPUBLIC OF KOREA

GOOD PRACTICE : Framework Act on Gender Equality (Act No.13369) latest amendments on Jun 22, 2015

TARGET GROUPS: Women and men whom are appointed into administrative positions within state and local government

- Republic of Korea highlighted their Framework Act on Gender Equality under the Art. 21 <sup>32</sup>(Participation in Policy-Making Processes) articulates the following:
  - i. The State and local governments shall prepare policies for equal participation of women and men in policy-making processes;
  - ii. In organizing various committees (referring to any collegiate committees such as committees, commissions, and councils, regardless of their names, comprised of several constituent members to respond to requests for consulting, or to make

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> UNDOC(2018), "Strengthening Anti-Corruption Institutions in Indonesia". Accessed via: https:// www. unodc. org/ documents/ evaluation/Independent\_Project\_Evaluations/2018/INDA03\_Final\_Independent\_Project\_Evaluation\_Report\_April\_2018.pdf.
 <sup>32</sup> <u>https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/13184Republic\_of\_Korea\_review\_Beijing20.pdf</u>.

coordination, consultations, or resolutions, on the affairs under jurisdiction of an administrative agency; hereinafter the same shall apply), the State and local governments shall ensure that any particular gender does not exceed 6/10 of the number of members commissioned: Provided, that the foregoing shall not apply where any inevitable ground, such as lack of professional workforce of a particular gender in the relevant field, is deemed to exist, and the Working Committee adopts a resolution thereon;

- iii. The State and local governments shall submit the annual state of participation of each gender in committees to the Minister of Gender Equality and Family, and the Minister of Gender Equality and Family may publicly announce such state of participation of each gender in committees and make recommendations to improve the situation;
- iv. In order to ensure the equal appointment of women and men to administrative positions, the State and local governments shall implement mid-to long-term policies, etc., which include the annual target of appointment to each agency (hereafter referred to as "administrative position target system" in this Article); and
- v. The heads of public agencies shall implement the administrative position target system, etc., and strive for the equal appointment of women and men to the executives positions of the relevant agencies.
- Other than legal provisions, the current office of day has 30% (7 out of 23) of women ministers appointed.

# 4. PAPUA NEW GUINEA

GOOD PRACTICE : National Public Service Gender Equity and Social Inclusion (GESI) Policy<sup>33</sup>

TARGET GROUPS: Individuals who are directly or indirectly being disadvantaged or discriminated against, including people living with disabilities, HIV/AIDS, discrimination on the basis of race, sex, gender or other personal attributes.

 GESI Policy guides agencies in underpinning gender equity and social inclusion in the service delivery and across workplaces. The policy provides practical and visionary strategies and guidelines for learning and incorporates the review and evaluation of existing systems and structures. These actions will ensure gender equity and social inclusion values and principles are front and centre and an essential part of Papua New Guinea's identity.

# 5. PERU

#### **GOOD PRACTICES:**

- National Policy for Integrity and Fight against Corruption (D.S. 092 2017-PCM);
- National Plan for Integrity and Fight against Corruption 2018 2021;
- Anti-Bribery Policy of the Ministry of Women and Vulnerable Population (Ministerial Resolution 169-2018- MIMP); and
- Bicentennial Plan: Peru towards 2021.

#### TARGET GROUPS: Public sector, Private sector and Civil society

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> National Public Service Gender Equity and Social Inclusion Policy Implementation – PNG UPDATE .Accessed from: <a href="http://devpolicy.org/Events/2015/2015-PNG-Update/Presentations/Day-1/Gender\_Davies.pdf">http://devpolicy.org/Events/2015/2015-PNG-Update/Presentations/Day-1/Gender\_Davies.pdf</a>

- National Policy for Integrity and Fight against Corruption (D.S. 092 2017-PCM)<sup>34</sup>establishes 3 main actions on which the Peru must work:
  - i) Preventive capacity of the state;
  - ii) Identification and risk management; and
  - iii) State sanctioning capacity.
- National Policy that was created with the active participation of different stakeholders (public sector, private sector and civil society).
- National Plan for Integrity and Fight against Corruption 2018 2021 (D.S. 044-2018-PCM) has 69 strategic actions focused on prevention and punishment of corruption cases.
- Mandatory compliance actions in the three levels of government, including the Ministry of Women and Vulnerable Populations.
- In this same sense, the National Plan seeks to promote an integrity culture and ethic inside the civil society, through training and awareness campaign.
- Gender Justice Commission of the Judiciary Branch was created to institutionalize the gender approach at all levels of the administration of justice at the domestic level, highlighting the political will of this State Power to achieve the goal of gender equality and eliminate discrimination against women in Peru.
- Anti-Bribery Policy of the Ministry of Women and Vulnerable Population (Ministerial Resolution 169-2018-MIMP) strictly prohibits the practice, promotion or tolerance of acts of corruption and bribery, directly or indirectly, for one's own benefit or for the benefit of others. - It also commits public servants to fight bribery in all its forms; to develop strategies and concrete actions on this issue.
- Bicentennial Plan: Peru towards 2021 is long-term plan that contains the domestic development policies that Peru must follow until 2021. It has establish six strategic axes, being the third on state and governance that determines the need to incorporate the design of a comprehensive strategy to fight corruption at all levels of government, as well as promote mechanisms for citizen participation in public decisions, strengthening its control capacity and ensuring transparency of public information and accountability in all instances.

# 6. THE REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES

GOOD PRACTICE : Gender Information Desk (GID) of Ombudsman Visayas, Cebu City established under Gender and Development Focal Point System (GFPS) 2015 TARGET GROUPS: Front liners & lawyers who handles gender related complaints

- Public Assistance (establishment and operation of gender information desk (GIDs) in the office of the ombudsman). The GID of Ombudsman Mindanao was launched on 25

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Offices of Institutional Integrity in Peru Implementing The Integrity System. Accessed from:<u>https://www.oecd.org/gov/ethics/offices-of-institutional-integrity-peru.pdf</u>

November 2015 in Davao City. The GID is a facility for promoting women empowerment and gender equality and for the rendition of assistance in a gender-responsive manner to individuals dealing with incidents involving abuse, discrimination, and violence against women and their children. The GIDs are operating at the PACPO<sup>35</sup> or the Public Assistance Unit. Among the notable initiatives conducted by GID is the "Gender Sensitivity Training Plus" (GST+) seminar. GST+, a more enhanced training module which incorporates the basic gender concepts and principles, wellness, stress management and income augmenting seminars - was conducted to further strengthen the Office's campaign for gender advocacy.

#### **Question 2:**

✤ Does your economy have anti-corruption laws/ subsidiary legislation/ rules/ regulations which explicitly address sextortion<sup>36</sup>?

#### 1. CANADA

GOOD PRACTICE: Non-Consensual Distribution of Intimate Images offence, & **Extortion offence-Criminal Code** 

TARGET GROUPS: Women and Men in Canada

- Non-Consensual Distribution of Intimate Images offence, & Extortion offence-Criminal Code (section 162.1) and section 346(1) (extortion)<sup>37</sup>.
- In certain circumstances, section 162 (voyeurism), section 163 (obscene publication), section 264 (criminal harassment), and sections 298-300 (defamatory libel) may apply.

#### **2. PERU**

#### **GOOD PRACTICES:**

- Legislative Decree No 1410 "Crime of Harassment, Sexual Harassment, sexual blackmail & dissemination of images, Audio visual, materials or audios with sexual content. (Article 176C-B criminal code;
- Peruvian National Police [High Technology Crime Investigation Division, DIVINDAT);
- The Prevention and Punishment of Sexual Harassment (Act N° 27942 and its Regulations (approved by Supreme Decree N° 014-2019-MIMP);
- Public Prosecution Service & National Police of Peru (implemented 2003); and
- Guidelines for the Prevention, Reporting, Care, Investigation and Sanction of Sexual Harassment in Public Entities (Resolution of the Executive Presidency N° 144-2019-SERVIR-PE).

**TARGET GROUP: Women** 

- Legislative Decree No 1410 "Crime of Harassment, Sexual Harassment, sexual blackmail & dissemination of images, audio visual, materials or audios with sexual content. (Article 176C-B criminal code, implemented 2018, Public Prosecution Service, and Peruvian National Police [High Technology Crime Investigation Division, DIVINDAT), implemented 2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> https://www.ombudsman.gov.ph/GAD/Gallery/2015%20GAD%20Activities.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> A combination of 'sex and extortion', which sex, not money, is the currency of the bribe. Defined by the International Association of Women Judges (IAWJ), sextortion is an abuse of power involving a demand for sexual favours. <sup>37</sup> Justice Law Website. Accessed from: <u>https://laws-lois.justice.gc.ca/eng/acts/C-46/section-162.1.html</u>

- The Prevention and Punishment of Sexual Harassment (Act N° 27942 and its Regulations (approved by Supreme Decree N° 014-2019-MIMP)
- "Prevents and punishes sexual harassment in relationships of authority or dependence (...)"
- (Public Prosecution Service, National Police of Peru), implemented 2003.
- Guidelines for the Prevention, Reporting, Care, Investigation and Sanction of Sexual Harassment in Public Entities (Resolution of the Executive Presidency N° 144-2019-SERVIR-PE) (National Civil Service Authority, SERVIR; Technical Secretariat of the Authorities of the Disciplinary Administrative Procedure, STPAD; Human Resources Offices; Public Prosecution Service; and National Police.

#### Question 3:

Does your economy's criminal justice system in relation to corruption and related offences take into account a gender responsive <sup>38</sup> perspective or approach in dispensation of justice?

#### 1. CANADA

GOOD PRACTICES:		
<ul> <li>Corrections and Conditional Release Act (S.C.1992, c.20); and</li> </ul>		
Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms of 1982 (part of Canada's Constitution)		
TARGET GROUPS: Women and Men in Canada		
- Punishment : Pursuant to ss. 4(g) of the Corrections and Conditional Release Act "The		
principles that guide the Service in achieving the purpose referred to in section 3 are as		
follows(g) correctional policies, programs and practices respect gender, ethnic,		
cultural, religious and linguistic differences, sexual orientation and gender identity and		
expression, and are responsive to the special needs of women, indigenous persons,		
visible minorities, persons requiring mental health care and other groups".		
- Laws/Policies/Enforcement/Prosecutions/Punishment- Section 15 of the Canadian		
Charter of Rights and Freedoms guarantees equality before and under the law, and the		
right to the equal protection and equal benefit of the law without discrimination and, in		
particular, without discrimination based on race, domestic or ethnic origin, colour,		
religion, sex, age or mental or physical disability. It applies to government legislation,		

regulations, directions, policies, programs, activities and the actions of government

agents carried out under lawful authority.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> The consistent and systematic attention given to the differences between women and men in society with a view to addressing structural constraints to gender equality [APEC Gender Inclusion Guidelines, p.13]

#### 2. MALAYSIA

#### **GOOD PRACTICES :**

• Malaysian Criminal Procedure Code (Act 593);

Violence & Sexual Crimes Unit –Attorney General Chambers Of Malaysia; and
Sexual Crimes Unit (D11) –Royal Malaysian Police.

TARGET GROUPS: Women and girls

- Sentence of whipping-Section 289 of Criminal Procedural Code<sup>39</sup>: No whipping is to be carried out on women, males sentenced to death, or any male over 50 years old (unless he has committed a sexual offence).

- The Attorney General Chambers has a domestic violence and sexual crimes unit.

- The Royal Malaysian Police Force has established a Sexual Crimes Unit to handle sexual crimes. This specialist section is designed to provide expertise, coupled with supportive attitudes and motivation, to the investigation of sexual crime. The unit is known as D11 have had an International Standardisation Organisation (ISO) standard certification since 2007. This means that they have to comply with international standards in their work and in their Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) and that they are audited annually.

# 3. PERU

#### GOOD PRACTICE : Peru Penal Code TARGET GROUPS: Women and girls

- The Peruvian criminal justice system for all crimes (not exclusively those related to corruption) incorporates a gender perspective to consider aggravating circumstances when justifying and determining the sanction:
  - i. Article 46 of the Criminal Code-Incorporates gender aspects; as long as they are not specifically intended to punish the crime and do not elements constitute a punishable offence.
  - ii. Article 108 B of the Criminal Code mentioned Feminicide crime and describes the penalty for anyone who kills a woman because of for her condition as such.
  - iii. Article 121 B of the Criminal Code states about severe injuries from violence against women and members of the family group

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Whipping provisions under the law.Accessed from: <u>http://www.dailyexpress.com.my/news.cfm?NewsID=93987</u>

#### Question 4:

✤ Does your economy adopt gender responsive budgeting<sup>40</sup>?

# 1. CANADA

#### GOOD PRACTICES:

- Gender Based Analysis Plus (GBA+); and
- Feminist International Assistance Policy

## TARGET GROUPS: Women and Men in Canada

- Gender Based Analysis Plus (GBA+) is applied to government budgeting at all levels and in all areas.
- In 2017, Canada adopted a Feminist International Assistance Policy recognizing that supporting gender equality and the empowerment of women and girls is the best way to build a more peaceful, more inclusive and more prosperous world. To do this, it supports targeted investments, partnerships, innovation and advocacy efforts with the greatest potential to close gender gaps and improve everyone's chance for success. But it also works across other action areas that reflect the multi-dimensional nature of poverty, in support of the Sustainable Development Goals. Working in this way leads to better development results and benefits everyone, including men and boys.
- Canada's feminist international assistance will help protect and promote the human rights of all vulnerable and marginalized groups and increase their participation in equal decision making. This will help women and girls achieve more equitable access to and control over the resources they need to secure ongoing economic and social equality. Committing to a feminist approach to international assistance represents a significant shift in how we work. A feminist approach is much more than focusing on women and girls; rather, it is the most effective way to address the root causes of poverty.

# 2. REPUBLIC OF KOREA

#### GOOD PRACTICES:

- Gender Responsive Budgeting under Framework Act on Gender Equality (Article 16); and
- National Finance Act (Article 16, Para.5).
- TARGET GROUPS: Women and men
- It covers most of public service areas. According to the number of projects categorized as gender responsive budgeting of central administrative offices in 2019, Ministry of Employment and Labour (36 projects), Ministry of Gender Equality (33), Ministry of Public Health and Welfare (30), Ministry of SMEs and Startups (24) have the highest number of projects under the category. The gender responsive budgeting is based on the Art. 16 of the Framework Act on Gender Equality and the Art. 16 Para.5 of the National Finance Act. The Act requires that the state and local governments analyze the impact of budget on women and men and implement gender responsive budgeting which reflects such impact in the financial operation of the government.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> An application of gender mainstreaming in the budgetary process. It means a gender-based assessment of budgets, incorporating a gender perspective at all levels of the budgetary process and restructuring revenues and expenditures in order to promote gender equality [APEC Gender Inclusion Guidelines, 13]

- In 2019, the number of projects of central administrative offices, categorized as gender responsive budgeting is 261 and its total budget was 25 trillion won (total government budget was 470 trillion won).

# 3. MEXICO

#### GOOD PRACTICES:

# Planning and the Federal Budget and Fiscal Accountability Acts; and 2013-2018 National Development Plan (NDP)

TARGET GROUPS: Women and girls

In Mexico, the analysis of public spending with a gender approach began in the 1990s. From 2008 and onwards, specific amounts for women and gender equality were earmarked and detailed in the annex 13<sup>41</sup> "Disbursements for Equality between Women and Men" of the annual Federal Budget. Annex 13 considers budgets for different sectors. As of the present year, it holds 110 budget programs from 32 governmental branches. The branches with the higher amounts of earmarked allocations are: Ministry of Welfare, National Council for Science and Technology (Conacyt), Ministry of Education, Ministry of Health, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, Ministry of Economy, Ministry of Agrarian, Territorial and Urban Development, Ministry of Labour, Ministry of Interior and Attorney General of the Republic.

#### 4. THE REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES

#### GOOD PRACTICE: Gender and Development (GAD) Budget Policy (1999) TARGET GROUPS: Women and men

- The Philippines has been engaged in gender-responsive budgeting, at the domestic and local levels and the Gender and Development (GAD) Budget Policy has evolved from a series of legislative mandates, including the Magna Carta of Women (1999) which requires all government agencies to allocate at least five percent of their budgets to address gender issues with the intention for the five per cent to influence the remaining 95 per cent.
- The Philippines has also taken steps to promote Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) at the sub-national level, including through the provision of technical assistance in conducting gender analysis of the socioeconomic situations of Local Government Units (LGUs) and integrating sex-disaggregated data into local planning and budgeting.<sup>42</sup>

#### 5. CHINESE TAIPEI

GOOD PRACTICE: Gender Equality Policy Guidelines (Act of Gender Equality in Employment, Gender Equity Education Act and Enforcement Act of CEDAW) TARGET GROUPS : Women and girls

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women: Concluding observations on the ninth periodic report of Mexico. Accessed from:

https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CEDAW/Shared%20Documents/MEX/CEDAW\_C\_MEX\_CO\_9\_3 1059\_E.docx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup>United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (2014). Empowering Women Economically: Illustrative Case Studies from Asia. Bangkok: ESCAP; UN Women Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (2016). Gender

Gender budget system has been promoted since 2009. The result of gender impact assessment was introduced into budgeting system, and the concept of "budget" was manifested through a "program" to facilitate effective resources allocation. Given that the approach could not reflect the situation of resource input to overall gender equality promotion, the definition of operation was revised, and trials were run in 2013. As a result, the coverage was expanded to "Gender Equality Policy Guidelines"<sup>43</sup>, regulations which promote gender equality (such as Act of Gender Equality in Employment, Gender Equity Education Act, three violence prevention acts, CEDAW and its Enforcement Act), and programs, solutions, or measures which promote gender equality.

## 6. THE UNITED STATES

# GOOD PRACTICE: Women's Entrepreneurship and Economic Empowerment Act of 2018

#### TARGET GROUPS: Women

- The United States welcomes efforts to disaggregate budgetary data based on sex, where appropriate and feasible within national contexts. The US recently enacted a law calling for gender analysis in international development efforts and our foreign assistance. The Women's Entrepreneurship and Economic Empowerment Act of 2018 calls on US Agency for International Development (USAID) to ensure USAID strategies, projects, and activities are shaped by a gender analysis. It also calls for the integration of gender equality and female empowerment throughout USAID's program cycle, including strategic planning, project design & implementation, and monitoring & evaluation. The Act also defines gender analysis in Section 3(c).

#### **Question 5:**

Does your Ministry/ Agency/ Body have officers trained on gender sensitivity<sup>44</sup>?

#### 1. AUSTRALIA

#### GOOD PRACTICES:

• Balancing the Future: Australian Public Service Gender Equality Strategy 2016-19; and

• The Office for Women under Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet. TARGET GROUPS: Women and the those from Public Service

- The Office for Women Officers in the Office for Women are trained in:

- i. women's safety;
- ii. women's economic security and prosperity;
- iii. international work; and
- iv. women's leadership.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> <u>https://gec.ey.gov.tw/en/8FB10983A3908085</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> The ability to recognize gender issues and to recognize women's different perceptions and interests arising from their different social position and roles. Gender sensitivity is often used to mean the same as gender awareness. It is actually the beginning of gender awareness which is more analytical and critical. [APEC Gender Inclusion Guidelines, 13]

- The Australian Public Service Commission (APSC) has a team, including subject matter experts, dedicated to providing policy advice and guidance to all Australian Public Service (APS) agencies on gender equality.
- The APSC is responsible for supporting agencies to implement the Balancing the Future: Australian Public Service Gender Equality Strategy 2016-19<sup>45</sup>.
- The APSC recommends that agencies provide clear policies and guidance for employees to ensure inclusive workplaces where gender equality is a high priority. All APS employees are expected to abide by a legislated Code of Conduct and Values which are consistent with the principles of gender equality.

# 2. HONG KONG, CHINA

#### GOOD PRACTICE : Labour & Welfare Bureau (Gender Focal Point) TARGET GROUPS: Women and men

- Each bureau and department has designated a "Gender Focal Point" (GFP)<sup>46</sup>. Majority of the GFPs are directorate officers. They serve as the contact and resource persons within their organisations and are tasked to help raise awareness and understanding of gender-related issues, and promote the application of the Gender Mainstreaming Checklist or the concept in the daily work of their staff. Specifically, they perform the following roles and functions:
  - i. Serve as the contact point within the bureau or department concerned and with the Labour and Welfare Bureau on gender-related issues;
  - ii. Collect and reflect views and concerns of the bureau or department concerned on various gender mainstreaming initiatives; and
  - iii. Promote gender mainstreaming in policy and programme formulation process. Help encourage the application of Gender Mainstreaming Checklist or the gender mainstreaming concept and the implementation of any other gender mainstreaming initiatives within the bureau or department concerned.

# 3. PERU

#### **GOOD PRACTICES :**

- The Public Prosecution Service (Training for Public Servants);
- Protocol for the Investigation of Feminicide Crimes;
- Working Group for the Elaboration of a Unified Format for Forensic Doctors; and • Gender Equality Committees.

#### **TARGET GROUPS: Men and Women**

-The Public Prosecution Service<sup>47</sup>-Trains its officials (at the School of the Public Prosecution Service) through specialized courses, diplomas and workshops that are

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Balancing the Future: The Australian Public Service Gender Equality Strategy 2016–19. Accessed from: <u>https://www.apsc.gov.au/sites/default/files/FINAL-Balancing-the-future-the-Australian-Public-Service-gender-equality-strategy-2016-19.pdf</u>

strategy-2016-19.pdf <sup>46</sup> Gender Focal Points Networks.Accessed from:<u>https://www.lwb.gov.hk/Gender\_Mainstreaming/en/gfp\_networks/</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> https://www.cidh.oas.org/women/Access07/chap3.htm

permanently offered to prosecutors at all levels, forensic doctors, forensic psychologists on women's rights and gender in order to ensure the application of domestic and international standards in the care of users, the receipt of complaints, the conduct of investigations and the gathering of evidence of these crimes in an appropriate manner.

- Protocol for the Investigation of Feminicide Crimes from a Gender Perspective, which provides officials with simple and nimble guidelines for effectively investigating and prosecuting the crime of femicide. It provides tools, general guidelines and/or lines of action.
- The Working Group for the Elaboration of a Unified Format for Forensic Doctors Acting on Women's Violent Deaths has been created in order to standardize the intervention of prosecutors and forensic doctors.
- The Ministry of Women and Vulnerable Population through its Gender Mainstreaming Directorate creates Gender Equality Committees in each Ministry or Public Institution and works on gender-sensitive human resource training.

# 4. CHINESE TAIPEI

#### GOOD PRACTICES

Gender Mainstreaming Training Plan for Civil Servants of the Agencies (1994); and
Gender Awareness Training Resources Integration Platform

**TARGET GROUPS: Civil Servants & Anti Corruption Officers** 

- Gender Mainstreaming Training Plan for Civil Servants of the Agencies, enacted in 1994. In which central department, local agencies were integrated to compile gender mainstreaming training info.
- Then Gender Awareness Training Resources Integration Platform was set up. Where the Agency Against Corruption (AAC) held several training courses for officers under the topic of Gender Equality Policy Guidelines-Gender on Safety & Justice. The purpose was to establish a mechanism for enacting gender equality policy in judicial system, to examine & oversee the establishment of a conducive environment for gender equality.

#### Question 6:

Do your Ministry/Agency/ Body develop anti-corruption policy/ initiative based on gender-analysis?

#### 1. PERU

#### **GOOD PRACTICES:**

- National survey on perception of corruption;
- Institutional Operational Plan Under The Public Prosecutor's Office; and
- Diagnosis of gender stereotypes.

#### TARGET GROUP: Women

- National Survey on perception of corruption, The Secretariat of Public Integrity with the support of PROÉTICA (Transparency International's Chapter in Peru)<sup>48</sup> are developing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Implementation Report 2015 Transparency International Secretariat. Accessed

from: https://www.transparency.org/files/content/ourorganisation/2015\_TI-S\_ImplementationReport\_EN.pdf

a domestic survey on perception of corruption 2019 that will include component of gender in order to identify how many cases or possible situation of sextortion occurred in Peru and what is the age range, among others.

- Institutional Operational Plan: The Public Prosecutor's Office has implemented the Institutional Operational Plan through which it carries out various actions in order to change socio-cultural patterns that reproduce unequal power relations and hierarchical differences that legitimize and exacerbate gender-based violence that disproportionately affects women.
- Diagnosis of gender Stereotypes (within the Public Prosecutor's Office to adopt institutional measures and policies in order to restructure stereotypes about the role of women in society and promoting the eradication of socio-cultural discriminatory. It is being carried out with the support of the Spanish Agency for International Cooperation).

#### Question 7:

Do your Ministry/ Agency/ Body implement gender mainstreaming<sup>49</sup> in decision-making positions?

#### 1. AUSTRALIA

#### **GOOD PRACTICES:**

- Diversity and Inclusion Plan;
- Amendments to the Legal Services Directions 2017;
- Diversity and Inclusion Strategy 2018-2020<sup>50</sup>; and
- Model Gender Equity Briefing Policy

TARGET GROUPS: Public Servant, Parliamentary members and Private Sector workers

- In Australia, implementing quotas is at the discretion of each political party. The Australian Labor Party is the only party with a quota, requiring at least 40% of its members to be women, which will increase to a 50% requirement in 2025.
- Public service (women as heads of ministry/department/agency/body). The Office for Women has a gender diversity target of women holding 50% of Government board positions. As at 30 June 2018, women hold 45.8% of board positions.
- ASIC has a Diversity and Inclusion Plan, which includes the women in ASIC Committee and sets out voluntary targets for women in leadership roles (at Executive Level 1, Executive Level 2, and Senior Executive Service levels). ASIC has reached their targets for EL1 and EL2 levels (50% of people at EL2 levels, and 52% of people at EL1 levels are women).
- The amendments to the Legal Services Directions 2017 encourage Commonwealth agencies to select female barristers when engaging counsel, with a view to having senior female barristers account for at least 25% of all briefs, and junior female barristers

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> The process of ensuring that women and men have equal access and control over resources, development benefits and decision-making, at all stages of the development process and in all government projects, programs and policy. [APEC Gender Inclusion Guidelines,p.12]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> https://www.police.sa.gov.au/\_\_data/assets/pdf\_file/0004/518134/Hi-Res-Diversity-and-Inclusion-Strategy-2018-2020.pdf

account for at least 30% of all briefs to meet the objectives of the objectives of the Law Council of Australia's Equitable Briefing Policy.

- The Commonwealth Director of Public Prosecutions has internal polices and guidelines which deal with matters of gender equality, corrupt and fraudulent behaviour, and procedural fairness, namely:
  - i. Diversity and Inclusion Strategy 2018-2020; and
  - ii. Model Gender Equity Briefing Policy.

# 2. CANADA

# GOOD PRACTICE: Employment Equity Act and Employment Equity Regulations<sup>51</sup> TARGET GROUPS: Women & LGBTQ2 in the Public sector & Private Sector

- Appointment of women to key leadership positions such as Government House Leader, RCMP Commissioner, Commandant of NATO Defence College and Judge Advocate General. Appointing a Special Advisor to the Prime Minister on LGBTQ2 issues and a Secretariat in the Privy Council Office to coordinate the government approach to LGBTQ2 issues; and
- Through the Employment Equity Act and Employment Equity Regulations, the core public service of Canada ensures representation with respect to four designated groups, one of which is women. Measures include instilling workforce availability benchmarks and promoting positive practices, such as, targeted recruitment and career development strategies for women in senior level positions across all departments. An emphasis on continual human resources planning is encouraged and has resulted in favourable representation rates above workforce availability for women at the executive ranks in the federal government.

# 3. PERU

# GOOD PRACTICE : Law No 30966 (amended by the Organic Law of Elections) TARGET GROUP: Public Servants

- Quota for women participation in parliament via Law No 30966 (amended by the Organic Law of Elections) states that in the next elections, the lists of candidates for Congress must include 40% of women or men, placed interspersed; and
- Women's participation as heads of ministry/department/agency/body are at 28% within the public sector.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> https://laws-lois.justice.gc.ca/eng/regulations/sor-96-470/index.html

#### Question 8:

Does (Do) your anti-corruption agency (ies) and/or law enforcement body (ies) conduct any gender-balanced awareness-raising campaigns against corruption?

#### 1. MALAYSIA

GOOD PRACTICE: Gerakan Anti-Rasuah Wanita (G-WAR) <sup>52</sup>
 TARGET GROUP: Women
 The "Gerakan Anti-Rasuah Wanita" (G-WAR) initiative of the MACC is created to bring women to join force as they will be the prime mover in birthing a culture that hates & rejects corruption. The establishment is in line with the third core strategy of the MACC's Strategic Plan 2017-2020 which advocates "enculturation of abhorrence towards corruption".

#### 2. PERU

#### GOOD PRACTICES:

- Women Doing Business-Women Fighting Against Corruption; and
- Women, Corruption & Confidence-Strategies
- TARGET GROUP: Women in Latin America
- Women Doing Business-Women Fighting Against Corruption: This activity was organized by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs with the participation of public officials from the Secretariat of Public Integrity, Judicial Branch, and women representatives of the private sector. This event had the purpose to make visible the contribution of women in the development of the Peruvian economy and especially in the fight against corruption.
- Training: Women, Corruption & Confidence-Strategies to address the differentiate impacts of corruption in Latin America. The Secretariat of Public Integrity with the support of EUROsociAL+ implemented the training "Women, Corruption and Confidence Strategies to address the differentiated impacts of corruption in Latin America" for public officials. The training was developed in 2 panels on corruption and human trafficking, sextortion and access of public services.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> <u>https://www.mynewshub.tv/terkini/wanita-berperanan-sebagai-ejen-antirasuah-menerusi-6-war/</u>

# APPENDIX C

# GENDER MAINSTREAMING AND WOMEN EMPOWERMENT FROM THE INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATION'S PERSPECTIVE

The following views and recommendations of international organizations which have helped shaped the policy recommendations in this publication are those from the UN Woman represented by Ms. Gaelle Demolis, UNODC represented Ms. Jennifer Sarvary Bradford and TI (Berlin) represented by Ms. Maria Emilia Berazategui, who participated in the Symposium to address the following issues/challenges associated with gender mainstreaming and women empowerment.

#### A. Issue/Challenge 1: Differential impact of corruption on women and men

**Speaker:** Ms. Gaelle Demolis, Programme Specialist for the Governance, Peace and Security Unit at the UN Woman Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific.

Corruption's impact on women might be greater than men when the currency of bribes is in the form of sexual favours (sextortion) as surveys conducted indicate that one in five women experiences sextortion or knows someone who has.<sup>53</sup>

#### • Proposed Recommendations:

- 1. Influx of new and foreign non-participants sufficiently included to disturb the networks [typically all male that excluded women from engaging or benefiting from corrupt activities] and reduces the effects of corruption;
- 2. Increasing the number of female politicians/public officials;
- 3. Creating a "fairer systems", public accountability and governance systems that are transparent and responsive to women's and men's needs;
- 4. Recruitment of more women in law enforcement reduces the risk of sextortion;
- 5. Reallocation of minimum of 30% women in elected assemblies to reduce petty and grand corruption; and
- 6. Emphasis to be given for the urgency that more data is needed on nexus between Gender and Corruption to be added to the existing database.

#### B. Issue/Challenge 2: Contextualizing sextortion and sexual violence

Speaker: Ms. Jennifer Sarvary Bradford, UNODC

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> The Deafening Silence around Sextortion. Accessed from : <u>https://www.transparency.org/en/news/the-deafening-silence-around-sextortion</u>

The concept of "sextortion" is an important addition to understanding of different forms of violence against women and girls and the enabling environment, attitudes, beliefs, and behaviours that perpetuate violence. In effect, sextortion is a form of corruption in which rather than money, sex, is the currency of the bribe.

# • Proposed Recommendations:

- 1. The private sector is to develop a gender-analysis on how business regulations, compliance and integrity requirements impact women's rights and participation by raising awareness on corruption issues faced by women in the private sector; and improve women's representation within middle-management level;
- 2. Civil Society Organizations (CSO) are:
  - (a) to find entry points by integrating anti-corruption and gender to issues of general importance such as gender-based violence, health, strategies, integrity platforms and education platforms;
  - (b) understand the systematic manner (of) the different roles and approaches taken by male and female anti-corruption activists; and finally
  - (c) utilize the social media to reach youth and the general public;
- 3. The UN system adaptation of a zero-tolerance policy towards sexual abuse and exploitation by the way of breaking the silence about violence against women via good governance and economic and social rights; and
- 4. Recognize and address specific gendered forms of corruption. Sexual extortion (sextortion), a form of corruption where sex is the currency of the bribe, is only one form of corruption that disproportionately affects women. Other forms of abusive behavior are not always recognized as corruption and are less likely to be reported due to a culture of shaming and victim blaming. Economies should ensure their judicial systems have the necessary tools and awareness to address sextortion cases.

# C. Issues/Challenges 3: Corruption's impact on gender equality

Speaker: Ms. Maria Emilia Berazategui, TI (Berlin)

Corruption disproportionately affects vulnerable populations especially women, who represent a higher share of the world's poor. To achieve gender equality, governments need to design and implement public policies with a gender perspective via partnership with civil society, the private sectors, trade unions and other stakeholders, and include common anti-corruption components.

#### • Proposed Recommendations:

- 1. "Collect, analyse and disseminate gender disaggregated data. Timely access to sufficient, accurate and up-to-date information is essential in order to design, implement and monitor effective public policies, and to better integrate gender into anti-corruption policies;
- 2. Include women in anti-corruption decision making. To ensure fairer access to political rights, women have to be part of the formulation, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of anti-

corruption policies;

- 3. Empower women. Women are less likely to report abuse, as they are often unaware of their rights and entitlements, which make them easier targets for corruption. Governments, international organizations, businesses and civil society organizations can and should play a key role to help ensure women have full knowledge of their rights through campaigns and information on gendered forms of corruption; and
- 4. Gender sensitive reporting mechanisms. Safe, accountable, accessible and, most importantly, gender sensitive mechanisms should be created to report corruption. These mechanisms should take into account cultural context and gender issues that might hinder reporting.

# APPENDIX D

# ENABLING MECHANISMS OF THE KEY POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS ON GENDER MAINSTREAMING AND WOMEN EMPOWERMENT TO FIGHT CORRUPTION

In order realise the objectives by economies in gender mainstreaming and empowering of women in the fight against corruption it is important to identify the relevant enabling mechanisms for each of the key policy recommendations formulated to be deemed actionable and viable.

The enabling mechanisms identified here below are by no means exhaustive but are intended to illustrate entry points (intervention) for consideration of the key policy recommendations subjected to the resources as well as the cultural, social, political and legal structures and systems of the individual economy concerned.

KEY POLICY RECOMMENDATION 1: Member economies are encouraged to introduce gender mainstreaming principles in their anti-corruption policies, plans, programmes and activities

Enabling Mechanism: Institutionalization of Gender Mainstreaming

The focus on an institutional setting means that gender mainstreaming is to be conceived as a strategy which is pursued as a systematic and planned process. The strategic goal of the process is to integrate gender equality into the regular rules, procedures and practices of an institution. A successful gender mainstreaming implementation will lead to the transformation of an institution, thus also impacting on the organizational/governmental management. The establishment of an institutional framework is to ensure the effective implementation, co-ordination and sustainability of the gender equality and mainstreaming strategy, by<sup>54</sup>:

- a. bolstering the capacities and resources of gender equality institutions to facilitate a consistent response at appropriate levels of government/organization and to develop, implement and monitor gendersensitive programmes and policies throughout the government/organization, based on gender-disaggregated statistics and indicators. Effectiveness of gender equality institutions can also be strengthened by placing them at the highest possible level in the government/organization;
- b. ensuring the capacity and resources of public/private institutions to integrate gender equality perspectives in their activities; for example, by identifying gender equality focal points across governmental/private bodies, by investing resources in training and promoting collaborative approaches with knowledge centres to produce gender-sensitive knowledge, leadership and communication, by ensuring the collection of gender and gender-disaggregated

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> OECD Toolkit for Mainstreaming and Implementing Gender Equality: Implementing the 2015 OECD Recommendation on Gender Equality in Public Life. Can be accessed via: <u>https://www.oecd.org/gov/toolkit-for-mainstreaming-and-implementing-gender-equality.pdf</u>

statistics in their areas of responsibility, and by providing clear guidelines, tools, communication and expectations to public/private institutions in this area; and

c. strengthening vertical and horizontal co-ordination mechanisms for policy coherence across governmental bodies and levels of government that involve relevant non- governmental stakeholders to ensure synergies and effective implementation of gender equality initiatives.

KEY POLICY RECOMMENDATION 2: Member economies are encouraged to review anti-corruption legislation or regulation as they relate to sex as the currency of a bribe

Enabling Mechanism: Criminalizing Sextortion

Sexual extortion, or what law enforcement officials commonly call sextortion, is a type of corruption in which "sex rather than money is the currency of the bribe," and it affects women and girls (and some men and boys) around the world. Despite its prevalence, it's rarely prosecuted (as either corruption or a sexual crime), it's less likely to be reported than other forms of corruption, and it's not tracked by most corruption measures. Greater public attention is needed to address sextortion as a serious crime that causes physical and mental harm and undermines confidence in public institutions.

In cases where sextortion is reported, it's not always prosecuted. While international tools like the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Violence Against Women (CEDAW) clearly prohibit sextortion, in some countries, domestic laws don't recognize sexual exploitation as a form of corruption. In other countries, laws exist that could be used to protect against sextortion but judges or lawyers don't apply them, viewing the sexual extortion as "consensual" and therefore non-violent, or as a lesser form of corruption than financial abuse. Both views miss the significant harm caused by sextortion - to the individual, and to the strength of the public institutions.

To reduce overall corruption, protect women and girls from the harms caused by genderbased violence, and improve trust in public institutions, economies should recognize and address sextortion as a significant but often ignored form of corruption and abuse. A first step is to ascertain towards a stronger anti-corruption laws and policies at national level. This will enable economies to improve accountability by increasing their prosecution of sextortion crimes.<sup>55</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup>Through a <u>2015 study</u> to "name, shame, and end" sextortion, the International Association of Women Judges analyzed gaps in criminal justice systems around the world to address sextortion, and recommended steps to strengthen domestic laws and policies. There is also <u>UN</u> and <u>NGO</u> resources to help organizations and economies raise awareness about sexual exploitation and abuse and improve their systems to prevent and address it. Can be accessed via:http://www.iawj.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/Corruption-and-Sextortion-Resource-1.pdf

#### KEY POLICY RECOMMENDATION 3: Member economies are encouraged to establish partnerships or collaborate with women-led organizations in preventing and fighting corruption

Enabling Mechanism: Grassroots Women Empowerment

Empowering grassroots women's perspectives on corruption is about recognizing the lack of information related to corruption and women, and acknowledging the importance of a bottomup approach to explore this phenomenon and illuminate's grassroots women's perceptions and lived experiences of corruption in developing economies, in the communities where they live and work. Grassroots women's definition of corruption is about their rights and entitlements to basic services, their right to water, to shelter, their children's right to education and so on. Therefore, their definition of corruption is much more nuanced where corruption is not limited to just 'misuse of power or bribery' but includes 'poor or absent service delivery', 'poor leadership or governance' and 'physical or sexual abuse'. The importance for empowering grassroots women cannot be overstated.<sup>56</sup>

KEY POLICY RECOMMENDATION 4: Member economies are invited to consider that existing and new complaint mechanisms to report corruption are gender-sensitive

Enabling Mechanism: Gender- Sensitive Anti-Corruption Reporting Framework

The perspective of gender sensitive training comprises of the existing and new complaint mechanism to report corruption should ensure (that) the frontline of the criminal justice providers such as the anti-corruption officers are able to appreciate how critical the first contact with the criminal justice system is for the victim of sextortion or sexual crimes and how this has an impact on her willingness to be further involved, and on the development of a case. As the frontline receivers of "sex of the currency" criminal cases, the anti-corruption officers are to be trained to have an immediate and determinant impact on victims and cases involving the violence and abuse power by the perpetrators against women. The following are the scope of initial contact and reporting framework that could be part of the gender sensitive training<sup>57</sup>:

- a. Ensuring a supportive environment for initial reception at the anti-corruption agencies is important for victims to feel that they can report to the authorities at the anti-corruption offices where their safety, privacy and dignity can be guaranteed;
- b. Responsiveness in handling complaints addresses the use of variety of measures, including policies that require prioritising calls involving violence against women in form of sexual favours and abuse power by authorities; documenting all calls; and ensuring that the anti-corruption officers has the power to enter premises and the power to make arrests;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup>Sangeetha, P(2020), Grassroot Women and Corruption. Can be accessed via:

https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Development/GoodGovernance/Corruption/SangeethaAntiCorruption.pdf : seventy – six percent (76%) of the women perceived that corruption has prevented their access to public goods and services. And it is not just limited to these basic services but includes documentation, law enforcement and businesses and jobs. They also have to pay in cash, kind or with their body when they seek jobs, when they run businesses, while trying to get their birth and death certificates or passports, in relation to land and property rights and while trying to seek justice. Therefore, there is a need to adopt an expanded definition of corruption to include the broad range of experiences that poor women have in relation to corruption.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Towards Gender Responsive Criminal Justice. Can be accessed via: <u>https://icclr.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/06/Towards-Gender-Responsive-Criminal-Justice.pdf</u>

- c. Strategies to encourage and assist women in lodging formal complaints and in following through complaints are important especially when the form of violence is categorised as a compoundable offence, which means that in such case an official investigation cannot be initiated unless the victim makes an official complaint;
- d. Providing anti-corruption officers who is trained to assist victims file their reports is important to shift the burden on the anti-corruption officers rather than the victim. This includes taking the victim's verbal report and then providing her a copy of the report or written acknowledgement of her complaint to the anti-corruption officers;
- e. Ensuring confidentiality when reporting and recognizing the right to privacy of the victim of violence has been legislated by economies in APEC region. Certain aspects include conducting closed-door investigation and not allowing the media to have access to any information regarding the victim of sexual related crimes;
- f. Providing the possibility of filing an anonymous report and third option programmes expands the options for victims to report to the anti-corruption agencies while at the same time respecting the challenges they face in engaging the criminal justice process;
- g. Gender-sensitive interviews have many different elements, some of which are found in the practices in this region, including having the victim interviewed by a multi-disciplinary team comprised of anti-corruption officers and psycho-socio worker during the reporting stage; and
- h. Prohibiting the anti-corruption officer who entertains victims complain from engaging in informal mediation. It is a practice that counters custom and community pressure on women to not pursue formal recourses or seek punitive measures, especially against intimate partner or individuals who are in close relationship or official relationship with the victim. There should be clear criteria set in the law when meditation can be used.

KEY POLICY RECOMMENDATION 5: Member economies are encouraged to collect Sex Disaggregated Data (SDD) for strategizing anti-corruption and related policies and plans

Enabling Mechanism: SDD or Gender Disaggregated Data (GDD) Collection and Analysis Framework

Most current anti-corruption strategies do not mention gender needs assessments conducted prior to the strategy's implementation, or do not make any specific mention of how corruption was affecting women versus men. Most anti-corruption plans remain gender blind in the sense that they do not account for the specific forms of corruption experienced by women (e.g., sexual extortion and trafficking), or for the role that gender plays in increasing women's vulnerabilities to exploitation by corrupt officials.<sup>58</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Alolo (2007a) conducted one of the few studies of integrating gender into a national anti-corruption strategy. The study revealed that there was no systematic attempt to incorporate gender issues into anti-corruption programmes in Ghana. For example, none of the agencies interviewed undertook routine research to explore the impact of their operations (prevention, investigation or prosecution) on women and men, or to ensure that the monitoring and evaluation of their anti-corruption work was gendersensitive. This is despite the fact that the staff of many of these agencies (e.g., the Commission for Human Rights and Administrative Justice and the Ghana News Agency) had a demonstrated appreciation of the relevance of women's engagement to their work. However, this appreciation was not shared by senior bureaucrats, whom Alolo reported as saying that they did not see any link between their work and gender roles and relations and thus saw no need for a gender-sensitive anti-corruption policy. UNDP (2010) Corruption, Accountability and Gender: Understanding the Connections. Can be accessed

The general lack of sex or gender-disaggregated data collection by anti-corruption or law enforcement authorities hinders the assessment on the gendered impacts of corruption, making it difficult to measure the different impacts of corruption on women and men and to improve targeted anti-corruption policies.

Strategic entry points for future programming to reduce the gendered impacts of corruption should include developing gender-sensitive tools, data and measurements and undertaking gender assessments. Data on gender and corruption can also be gathered through gender assessments. A gender-specific corruption assessment should include consultations with civil society in order to understand how corruption impacts women differently than men within similar socio-economic groups; where and why corruption occurs in its various forms and frequencies; and what its costs are to women's and men's well-being. Moreover, to develop anti-corruption policies that promote gender equality, economies must first assess the situation of women and men, and girls and boys. This might involve collecting and analysing data on a range of issues including but not limited to:

- a. Conditions of work, safety, withholding of wages, sexual harassment at work, unionization;
- b. Employment by sector proportion of workers in each sector that are women and men;
- c. Participation in education, highest level of qualifications, and subjects studied;
- d. Access to public services including health, education etc;
- e. Rates of domestic and sexual violence and abuse, both reported to police and un-reported;
- f. Conviction rates for domestic and sexual violence and abuse; and
- g. Social attitudes, particularly to gender equality, education of girls etc.

#### **KEY POLICY RECOMMENDATION 6:**

Member economies are invited to pursue policies on promoting women's participation in decision-making positions in public and private sectors, in support of research that correlates gender diversity with reduced corruption

Enabling Mechanism: Gender Equality in Recruitment

Gender equality in recruitment will ensure indiscrimination and unfairness treatment from one gender to another. Fighting corruption by increasing female participation in decision making positions in public/private sector would diminish the need for a painful, expensive, and politically difficult process of rooting out corruption via oversight and prosecution. Economies would also have a monetary incentive to promote gender equality, bringing needed attention to the unequal status of women around the world. An analysis done in University of Elon, USA, utilizing data from the 2016 Global Peace Index, Transparency International's 2016 Corruption Perception Index and World Bank data shows that economies with a higher percentage of women in government have less level of corruption. It also shows that economies are more peaceful when they have a higher percentage of women on a country's peace level are more because of their role in reducing corruption than because of their higher representation and resulting indirect impacts. Understanding women's participation in public/private sector as a pathway to overcome corruption and increase peace presents an important call to action

via:https://www.undp.org/content/dam/aplaws/publication/en/publications/womens-empowerment/corruption-accountability-and-gender-understanding-the-connection/Corruption-accountability-and-gender.pdf

among activists and practitioner's alike. <sup>59</sup> Women's education and participation in public/private sector should be promoted as ensuring women's rights and not as only an anticorruption strategy. At the same time, women's engagement in anti-corruption efforts contributes to both improving integrity and accountability as well as to building governance systems that are more responsive to women's needs. In advocating for greater participation of women in public/private sector and supporting women leaders/entrepreneurs, it is recommended to build alliances including both prominent women and men already reputable in both public/private spheres.<sup>60</sup>

KEY POLICY RECOMMENDATION 7: Member economies are invited to consider training anti-corruption officers, as applicable, on gender responsiveness and gender sensitivity

Enabling Mechanism: Gender Sensitive Training

The context of gender sensitive training is to equip anti-corruption officers with the capacity and know-how in addressing and handling of cases associated with gender based corruption and abuse of power. This training addresses, the differences between women and men, the role of women in social context and gender equality. The increasing attention has been given to the promotion of a comprehensive and multi-sectoral response to violence against women, including the need for gender-responsive training given to anti-corruption officers and the criminal justice system. Appreciating that violence against women remains highly prevalent, socially tolerant and largely unpunished crime, number of practices over the years have been introduced in order to establish positive conditions for women to engage with the anticorruption authorities and the criminal justice system. The following are the guiding framework that is part of the gender sensitive training which is human right based and victim-survivorcentred:

- a. Ensuring that gender sensitive trained anti-corruption officers are available to treat and communicate with victims is crucial to prevent secondary victimization;
- b. Dedicated anti-corruption officers or specialized desk that are trained and equipped to respond to all forms of violence including sextortion against women;
- c. Multi-disciplinary enforcement authorities are an example of specialised investigation units having multi-disciplinary team, where the anti-corruption officers are trained to work with victim support services or psycho-social workers when handling gender-based violence such as sextortion cases and reach women at first contact;
- d. Specific anti-corruption agency protocols/standard operating procedures to ensure that the gender sensitively trained anti-corruption officers knows clearly the features of specific protocols and standard operating procedures include procedures that: do not require the victim to confront the accused; ensure confidentiality; connect the victim with support and assistance; provide guidance on how to deal with reluctant victims; and identify high risk cases;
- e. Guidelines for victim- centred investigations are to be part of the gender sensitive trainings including inter-agency protocols for the police officers, anti- corruption officers, forensic officers, and healthcare provider for the collection and preservation of forensic evidence in cases of violence against women; and
- f. Victim assistance provided the trained prosecution office and anti-corruption officers to make the victim of gender -based violence feel her report is taken seriously and her complaint is regarded as credible and valid of which may

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> <u>http://www.developmentchannel.org/2019/08/19/more-women-in-power-means-less-corruption-and-more-peace-study/</u> <sup>60</sup> <u>https://images.transparencycdn.org/images/2014\_Policybrief1\_GenderEqualityCorruption\_EN.pdf</u>

prevent and reduce secondary victimization and draw away the hesitance of reporting these cases.

KEY POLICY RECOMMENDATION 8: Member economies are encouraged to consider Gender Responsive Budgeting as a potential means of promoting gender equality in anti-corruption initiatives

Enabling Mechanism: Gender Responsive Budgeting

Gender considerations also need to be integrated into the resource mobilisation and budgeting process (planning, implementation, reporting and oversight) to make sure women's concerns are properly reflected in the budget and that resource allocation equally benefits men and women. Earmarking funds and setting expenditure targets for gender equality programming is an important factor to ensure desired results. This can include allocating sufficient human resources to coordinate and oversee gender integration activities, allocating sufficient resources to hire gender experts or conduct gender activities, such as gender training for staff and project partners.

Gender-sensitive budgeting supports gender mainstreaming efforts by assessing the impact of government or organization's revenue and expenditure policies on women and men. This approach helps ensure that the necessary resources are allocated to achieve the goal of gender equality. Budlender and Hewitt (2003)<sup>61</sup> identify a five-step approach to engendering budgets:

- a. analysing the situation of women, men, girls and boys;
- b. assessing; the gender responsiveness of policies;
- c. assessing budget allocations;
- d. monitoring spending and service delivery; and
- e. assessing outcomes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> https://www.u4.no/publications/mainstreaming-gender-and-human-rights-in-anti-corruption-programming