

--	--	--

**FINAL REPORT ON COMPONENTS 1 AND 2 TRAINING
APEC CTI TILF PROJECT CTI: 29/2001T
MULTILATERAL RECOGNITION ARRANGEMENT (MLA)
READINESS PROJECT
IN PRODUCT CERTIFICATION**

**Belinda Mort
Project Coordinator**

November 2002

--	--	--

Introduction.....	4
Objectives	4
COMPONENT 1 – TRAINING FOR PRODUCT CERTIFICATION BODIES.....	5
Description of the Project.....	5
Purpose.....	5
Participants.....	5
Component 1 – Hong Kong, China, 10 to 14 June 2002	6
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	6
Presenter’s comments on the Project	6
Consolidated After-Course Evaluation by Participants	8
Component 1 – Chinese Taipei, 29 April to 3 May 2002	11
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	11
Participants’ Report on Completion of Project	12
Participants List Component 1 Training – CNAB Chinese Taipei	13
Component 1 – Malaysia, 23 to 27 September, 2002	14
Trainers Report on Completion of Project	14
Participants’ Report on Completion of Project	15
Component 1 – Philippines – 19 to 23 August, 2002	16
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	16
Participants’ Report on Completion of Project	17
Component 1 – Mexico – 24 to 28 June, 2002	18
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	18
Participants’ Report on Completion of Project	20
Participants List	20
Component 1 – Indonesia – 20 – 24 May, 2002	21
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	21
Participants’ Report on Completion of Project	22
List of Participants for Component 1 Training - Indonesia.....	23
Component 1 – Korea – 1 to 5 October, 2002.....	25
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	25
Participants’ Report on Completion of Project	26
Component 1 – Thailand - 29 July to 2 August, 2002.....	27
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	27
Participant’s Report on Completion of Project	28
Component 1 - Vietnam – 4 to 9 November, 2002	29
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	29
Participant’s Report on Completion of Project	31
List of Participants	31

--	--	--

COMPONENT 2	32
TRAINING FOR ACCREDITORS OF PRODUCT CERTIFICATION BODIES	32
Description of the Project.....	32
Purpose.....	32
Participants.....	32
Component 2 – Vietnam – 14 to 19 October, 2002	33
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	33
Participants’ Report on Completion of Project	35
List of Participants on the APEC Workshop on Guide 65.....	36
Component 2 – Malaysia – 2 to 6 September, 2002	37
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	37
Participants’ Report on Completion of Project	38
Component 2 – Mexico – 10 to 14 June, 2002	39
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	39
Participants’ Report on Completion of Project	41
List of Participants	41
Component 2 – Singapore – 20 to 24 May, 2002.....	42
Trainer’s Report on Completion of Project	42
Participants’ Report on Completion of Project	43
CONCLUSIONS.....	44
Objectives	44
• Component 1	44
• Component 2.....	44
Timeliness.....	44
Budget.....	44
Problems.....	44
Gender Considerations	44
Dissemination of Project Output	45

**FINAL REPORT ON COMPONENTS 1 AND 2 TRAINING
APEC CTI TILF PROJECT CTI: 29/2001T
MULTILATERAL RECOGNITION ARRANGEMENT (MLA)
READINESS IN PRODUCT CERTIFICATION**

Introduction

The purpose of this project is to develop the technical infrastructure of member economies, particularly in product certification and accreditation of product certification bodies. For a MLA in product certification to be operational in APEC, product certification bodies need to align their schemes with international guidelines (ISO/IEC Guide 65 and associated IAF Guidance) and accreditation body schemes with ISO/IEC Guide 61. Most accreditation bodies from developing economies require assistance in drawing up their schemes in accordance with these international guidelines. The abovementioned infrastructure is necessary for APEC economies to enter into an MLA in product certification, which will ultimately result in facilitation of trade in the APEC region.

To this end the Pacific Accreditation Cooperation (PAC) has commenced operations on a Multilateral Recognition Arrangement (MLA) for Product Certification, so as to facilitate the flow of goods and services in the APEC region. The project contributes to enhancement of capability of product certification / accreditation bodies of APEC member economies.

Objectives

The project is designed to enable:

- Product Certification Bodies to operate their schemes in accordance with ISO/IEC Guide 65:1996 General Requirements for Bodies Operating Product Certification Schemes; (Component 1)
- Accreditation bodies in APEC economies to align their schemes for accreditation of product certification bodies to ISO/IEC Guide 61:1996 General Requirements for Assessment and Accreditation of Certification / Registration Bodies (Component 2);
- Training for peer evaluators to enable them to participate in a peer evaluation and become recognised team members in the PAC MLA process. This will strengthen equivalency of product certification schemes throughout the region (Component 3).

This report deals with the provision of Components 1 and 2 training only. Component 3 training has been extended to September 2003, to enable member economies who have participated in the first two components time to apply for membership of the PAC MLA for Product Certification, and to nominate appropriate staff members to receive Component 3 training.

	APEC Project No: CTI 29/2001T Multilateral Recognition Arrangement (MLA) Readiness Project in Product Certification	
--	---	--

COMPONENT 1 – TRAINING FOR PRODUCT CERTIFICATION BODIES

Description of the Project

Purpose

The purpose of the Component 1 training was to provide assistance to developing product certification bodies in APEC member economies, to enable them to operate a product certification scheme in accordance with ISO/IEC Guide 65. This was achieved by provision of experts to identified product certification bodies for 5 days of intensive training.

Participants

Funding was received for 15 participants under this component. The following 9 APEC member economies participated in Component 1:

- Hong Kong, China
- Chinese Taipei
- Vietnam
- Malaysia
- Philippines
- Mexico
- Indonesia
- Korea
- Thailand

Singapore, Russia and PR China were approached to participate, however they declined. Other APEC member economies such as Peru, Chile and Papua New Guinea were approached on several occasions and failed to respond.

All of the training has been undertaken at 12 November 2002. The following pages provide reports from the trainers and some of the participant certification bodies on each individual course.

Component 1 – Hong Kong, China, 10 to 14 June 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

Mr Andrew Green visited Hong Kong 10-14 June as a guest of Hong Kong Q-Mark Council. The latter organised the training facilities and the attendance of the students; also arranging copies of course overheads, plus procedures and ISO/IEC Guides required for the course.

The training course covered an introduction to ISO/IEC Guide 65, and was delivered over three (3) days. Twelve (12) students attended, successfully completing the course. The remaining two (2) days were used for:

- document review of Hong Kong Q-Mark Council system documentation against ISO/IEC Guide 65;
- witness audit of Hong Kong Q-Mark Council auditor conducting product certification audit; and
- delivery of advice and consultancy to Hong Kong Q-Mark Council about their product certification scheme.

Student comments on the Project

The students filled out a total of three (3) evaluation forms each. These comprised:

- Hong Kong Q-Mark Council evaluation form;
- JAS-ANZ standard training course evaluation form; and
- APEC evaluation form.

Copies of the 12 completed versions of the latter two forms were posted to the project coordinator on 5 July. Perusal of the evaluation forms will show that the course was very well received by the students. This includes positive comments about course content, presentation and structure.

Presenter's comments on the Project

- Course facilities were quite good; certainly adequate for the exercise.
- The three day format is better for this course.
- Lunch should have been provided for the students.
- Students attending participated actively in the course, asking many questions and clearly enjoying the group exercises (workshops). This contributed greatly to the success of the course.
- It is not known why Hong Kong Q-Mark Council was chosen to 'host' and arrange the course (in fact representatives of Hong Kong Q-Mark Council even queried why they had been 'chosen'). The Project should have been given to Hong Kong Accreditation Service to coordinate. This organisation could have arranged a larger and more representative number of students.
- It is likely that there would be many more students in Hong Kong and surrounding regions who would wish to attend such a course if it was offered again.

The presenter also considers that the APEC Secretariat needs to improve its service in relation to:

- late payment of monies owed under the contract with the presenter (as at this date, payment has still not been made for the course presented 29 April - 2 May 2002). This delay is totally unacceptable given that service has been delivered to specifications and to the satisfaction of the customers; and
- requirements imposed on the presenters which are not mentioned in the contract with the presenter (eg. need to survey course participants; also need to complete this report before payment will be authorised). APEC needs to rethink its contract format and content so that all parties are clearly aware of requirements before agreeing to undertake the work.



Andrew Green
JAS-ANZ
Course Presenter

Component 1 – Hong Kong, China, 10 to 14 June 2002

Consolidated After-Course Evaluation by Participants

KEY - for questions with an asterisk
 6 = Excellent; 5 = Very Good; 4 = Good; 3 = Satisfactory; 2 = Fair; 1 = Poor

There are in total 12 participants in this training. (12) Yes/ (0) No – This represents 12 participants ticked “yes” and no participant ticked “no” in the question being asked.

The Course

1. Did the course meet the objectives stated in the leaflet? (12) Yes / (0) No
 2. In your opinion, was the course duration appropriate? (12) Yes / (0) No
 3. Was the course conducted at a right pace? (12) Yes / (0) No
 4. Were the course materials delivered clearly? (11) Yes / (0) No
 5. Were the course materials covered suitable for your level? (12) Yes / (0) No
 6. * What is your overall rating for the course? (3.87)
 7. Was the elaboration of Guide 65 requirements provided with sufficient cases?
(10) Yes / (2) No
- Comments from participants:
- More real example should be given (3 responses)
 - Some case studies may be added to the course (1 response)
8. Did IAF provide sufficient interpretation of Guide 65 requirements?
(11) Yes / (1) No
 9. Were sufficient workshops designed to enable understanding of Guide 65 requirements?
(12) Yes / (0) No
 10. Was sufficient time allocated to discuss problems on Guide 65 requirements?
(12) Yes / (0) No
 11. Was sufficient time allocated to discussion on requirements of other relevant ISO guides?
(7) Yes / (5) No

Comments from participants:

- More details should be given on comparison between ISO guide 62 and 66 (1 response)
- More on ISO58 and 27 (1 response)
- Too many ISO guides were mentioned. Unless the trainees are very familiar with them, they may find difficulties in following (1 response)

	APEC Project No: CTI 29/2001T Multilateral Recognition Arrangement (MLA) Readiness Project in Product Certification	
--	---	--

12. Was the trainer capable of solving all problems raised against Guide 65 requirements? (1) Yes / (0) No

13. Which topics provide you most valuable knowledge in implementing product certification program?

Comments from participants:

- Decision on certification (1 response)
- Demonstrate "Impartiality" (1 response)
- IAF guidance in interpreting Guide 65 requirements (1 response)
- The workshop discussed during the course (2 response)
- Assessment technique (1 response)
- Requirements of subcontracting laboratory/inspection body (1 response)
- Certification body organization (1 response)
- ALL (1 response)
- Competence (1 response)

14. What other topics you think should include in this training in order to have a better understanding of Guide 65 requirements?

Comments from participants:

- Techniques in auditing product certification bodies of type 5 (1 response).
- ISO/IEC17025 (laboratory system operation) (1 response)

15. Besides workshops, will additional case study or audit role-play enhance your understanding and implementation of the Guide 65 requirements?

Comments from participants:

- Audit role-play is preferable (1 response)
- Enough (1 response)
- Yes (1 response)
- Yes, case-study and role-play (1 response)
- Yes, role-play has enhanced the understanding (1 response)
- None (1 response)

16. Will an examination at the end of the course with an APEC certificate issued enable participants to fully comprehend his/her understanding of the course material, i.e. Guide 65 requirements? (8) Yes / (4) No

Comments from participants:

- A certificate but no examination (1 response)
- A certificate with examination, as it will force the trainees to learn (1 response)

	APEC Project No: CTI 29/2001T Multilateral Recognition Arrangement (MLA) Readiness Project in Product Certification	
--	---	--

17. In your opinion, which is/are the most useful topic(s) in the course?

Comments from participants:

Organization structure of Guide 65 (1 response)

Interpretation of the guide (2 responses)

Conditions for certification decision on certification (3 responses)

Workshops (2 responses)

Brief background of ISO Guide 65 (1 response)

Certification Body (1 response)

18. Were the topics sufficiently covered? (12) Yes / (0) No

19. Does the course benefit you/your company? (12) Yes / (0) No

20. * Rating on the presenter of this training, i.e. Mr. Andrew Green

Mr. Andrew Green	Average scores of 12 participants
- Professional knowledge of the subject	(5)
- Preparation	(4.5)
- Presentation skills	(4.4)
- Techniques in getting participants involved	(4.5)
- Ability to assist with problems	(4.8)

List of Participants

Mr CL Tang	Hong Kong Q-Mark Council
Mr Jack Tsui	Hong Kong Q-Mark Council
Mr Gallant Lai	Hong Kong Q-Mark Council
Mr Shum Wai Leung	Hong Kong Accreditation Service
Mr Tommy Fung	Hong Kong Accreditation Service
Mr Cheung Chin-keung	Hong Kong Accreditation Service
Mr Vincent CY Kong	Bureau Veritas Quality International
Mr Ir Chapman Chan	Intertek Testing Services
Mr Nigel CL Cheung	Hong Kong Testing Co. Ltd
Mr Wilson Wong	Hong Kong Standards & Testing Centre
Mr C Bala-Subramaniam	Hong Kong Quality Assurance Agency
Mr Anthony So	Civil Engineering Dept of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region

Component 1 – Chinese Taipei, 29 April to 3 May 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

Mr Andrew Green visited Chinese Taipei 29 April - 2 May as a guest of the Bureau of Standards, Metrology and Inspection, Ministry of Economic Affairs. The latter organised the training facilities and the attendance of the students; also arranging copies of course overheads, plus procedures and ISO/IEC Guides required for the courses.

The training course covered an introduction to ISO/IEC Guide 65, and two (2) courses were delivered back to back over two (2) days each; a total of four (4) days. A total of forty (40) students successfully completed the courses. The remaining one (1) day (Project total 5 days) was used for delivery of advice and consultancy to Bureau of Standards, Metrology and Inspection, Ministry of Economic Affairs (and others) about various issues relating to product certification.

Student comments on the Project

The students filled out a total of forty (40) copies of the JAS-ANZ standard training course evaluation form. Copies of the 40 completed JAS-ANZ evaluation forms were posted the Project Coordinator on 5 July. Perusal of the evaluation forms will show that the course was very well received by the students. This includes positive comments about course content, presentation and structure.

Presenter's comments on the Project

- Course facilities were excellent; certainly adequate for the exercise.
- Students attending participated actively in the course, asking many questions and clearly enjoying the group exercises (workshops). This contributed greatly to the success of the course.

The presenter considers that the APEC Secretariat needs to improve its service in relation to:

- late payment of monies owed under the contract with the presenter (as at this date, payment has still not been made for this course). This delay is totally unacceptable given that service has been delivered to specifications and to the satisfaction of the customers; and
- requirements imposed on the presenters which are not mentioned in the contract with the presenter (eg. need to survey course participants; also need to complete this report before payment will be authorised). APEC needs to rethink its contract format and content so that all parties are clearly aware of requirements before agreeing to undertake the work.



Andrew Green
JAS-ANZ
Course Presenter

Component 1 – Chinese Taipei, 29 April to 3 May 2002

Participants' Report on Completion of Project

The Component 1 Training for Chinese Taipei was held on April 29 to May 3, 2002. It was well received by regulators and certification bodies. 25 delegates from regulators and 30 delegates from accreditation/certification bodies attended the course.

This training intends to assist the APEC member economies in developing the technical infrastructure required in product certification and accreditation of product certifications, so as to facilitate the operation of Multilateral Recognition Arrangement (MLAs) in production certification in the APEC. ISO/IEC Guide 65 was developed for the use of certification bodies to ensure the consistency and reliability of their operation, which will facilitate trade by building the confidence required for acceptance on national and international basis.

It was a good opportunity for our certification bodies and related authorities to become familiar with the content and application of ISO/IEC Guide 65.

The training took the form of short presentations on ISO/IEC Guide 65, followed by group discussions and report back to the full sessions. A number of ideas and observations arose out of the training for participants to take back to their organizations for further considerations.

The training also highlighted the view of the participants on how to better implement the ISO/IEC Guide 65. A number of recommendations were given at the training. In summary these suggestions are:

- To include more case studies to illustrate the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65.
- A comparison among ISO/IEC Guide 65, 62, 39 and ISO/IEC 17025, as these Guides or Standards do have a great deal of similarities. The comparison will enable the practitioners to have a complete picture of the requirements because most certification bodies are also providing services in those areas.

Report provided by:

Dr Jay San Chen
Deputy Director General
Bureau of Standards, Metrology and Inspection
Chinese Taipei

	APEC Project No: CTI 29/2001T Multilateral Recognition Arrangement (MLA) Readiness Project in Product Certification	
--	---	--

Participants List Component 1 Training – CNAB Chinese Taipei

Please note that the following list is not complete. It was compiled from the Participants' Survey forms and not all attendees wrote their names on the forms.

Chih-hung Hsieh	
Chan-yan Chen	
Leong-Lang Yeh	
Wu-chuan Yao	
Sylvia Lin	
S H Lin	
Gi-sheng Chen	
Chin-Feng Chao	
Wang-Hung Ju	
Tsung-Hsing SHIEH	BSMZ
Jin Bin-Own	
Shih-Chih Huang	
Hang-Ing Shyas	
Jerry Chi-Ray Wu	
Jeff Chen	
Meggie Chu	CNAB Chinese Taipei
Yuh-guang Jin	CNAB Chinese Taipei
Simon Hsu	Automotive Research & Testing Center
Han-chen Kwo	
Thomas Hoy	
Kuo-Ming Lin	CNAB Chinese Taipei
Kwang-hwa Chen	

Component 1 – Malaysia, 23 to 27 September, 2002

Trainers Report on Completion of Project

Mr Brett Abraham visited Malaysia and provided the Component 1 training from 23 to 27 September as a guest of SIRIM, the only certification body responsible for product certification in Malaysia. SIRIM kindly organised the training facilities and invited the participants to attend; also arranging copies of the course overheads, standards and other reference documents.

SIRIM provides certification for a wide range of products (mechanical, construction materials, chemical, food product, electrical and electronic, fire protection equipment etc). SIRIM's quality manuals and procedures are aligned to Guide 65, but have not to date been audited by a third party.

The Product Certification Unit employs 27 auditors and 5 supporting staff. The training was presented to nineteen (19) technical staff.

The training was structured in two parts:

- Days 1 and 2 Training / seminar
- Days 3, 4 and 5 Gap Analysis Audit against the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65

Participant's comments on the Project

The participants filled out a total of fifteen (15) APEC evaluation forms. These were posted to Ms B Mort at the PAC Secretariat as requested. Perusal of the evaluation forms will show that the participants were very pleased with the structure and content of the training as reflected in the group's average overall rating of the project was 4.5 out of 5.

Presenter's comments on the Project

- Course facilities were certainly adequate for the exercise.
- Participants attending participated actively in the course, asking many questions and clearly enjoying the group exercises (workshops). This contributed greatly to the success of the course.

The APEC Secretariat is encouraged to ensure:

- prompt payment of monies owed under the contract;
- more reasonable expectations in terms of evidence of travel and expenses; and
- that future contracts include all reporting expectations.

Brett Abraham
JAS-ANZ
Course Presenter

Component 1 – Malaysia, 23 to 27 September, 2002

Participants' Report on Completion of Project

The lecture course on Guide 65 conducted on the 1st two days of the 1-week course was very relevant to all the participants. (All the participants are auditors of the Product Certification Scheme). The trainer has provided a clear understanding of the Guide. He has gone into details every clause of the Guide, including reference to the IAF interpretive documents. He has also provided cases of typical product certification system developed for certain categories of products, which in this case is an eye-opener to the participants as most cases in SIRIM are a typical type 5 Certification.

During the Gap Analysis session, the trainer has gone thoroughly over the quality manual and procedures available. He has highlighted a few findings, which he feels may not fulfil Guide 65 requirements. He has also studied a few certification cases handled by the Product Certification Unit, which he then relates it to the requirements of the Guide 65. He had especially gone into details requirements of "related bodies" addressed by Guide 65, the Certification Mark (which we had a lot of inquiries, and Mr. Brett Abraham had taken the liberty to make a long distance call to his colleague to clarify the matter), and the certificate issued by SIRIM's Product Certification.

In summary, we found the training to be a success. It has provided us with a good insight of the status of the Product Certification Unit with regards to Guide 65 requirements.

Nur Fadhilah Muhammad
Senior Manager
Product Certification Unit
SIRIM-QAS

Component 1 – Philippines – 19 to 23 August, 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

Mr Brett Abraham visited the Philippines and provided the Component 1 training from 19 to 23 August as a guest of the Philippine Bureau of Product Standards. BPS kindly organised the training facilities and invited the participants to attend; also arranging copies of the course overheads, standards and other reference documents.

BPS is responsible for a product certification scheme known as the Philippine Standard (PS) Certification Mark Scheme. To date, the BPS has certified 380 companies and issued Philippine Bureau of Product Standards 585 PS Licenses covering ninety 90 product lines. These product lines include: electrical products; building and construction materials; consumer products; mechanical; chemical and agricultural products.

In response to BPS' request, the training was presented to about twenty (20) technical staff.

The training was structured in two parts:

- Days 1 and 2 structured training and seminar
- Days 3, 4 and 5 Gap Analysis Audit of the BPS system against the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65 and associated IAF guidance.

Participant's comments on the Project

The participants filled out a total of seventeen (17) APEC evaluation forms. These were posted to Ms B Mort at the PAC Secretariat as requested. Perusal of the evaluation forms will show that the participants were very pleased with the structure and content of the training as reflected in the group's average overall rating of the project was 4.76 out of 5.

Presenter's comments on the Project

- Course facilities were certainly adequate for the exercise.
- Participant's attending participated actively in the course, asking many questions and clearly enjoying the group exercises (workshops). This contributed greatly to the success of the course.

The APEC Secretariat is encouraged to ensure:

- prompt payment of monies owed under the contract;
- more reasonable expectations in terms of evidence of travel and expenses; and
- that future contracts include all reporting expectations.

Brett Abraham
JAS-ANZ
Course Presenter

Component 1 – Philippines – 19 to 23 August, 2002

Participants' Report on Completion of Project

Relevance of Course Content

Introduction to ISO/IEC Guide 65 (19-20 August 2002)

- This two-day seminar was very relevant. The seminar was attended by all the staff of the Standards Conformity Division and other key personnel of the BPS. This seminar was very important as we now have a better understanding of the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65. Equally important is the common understanding of the provisions of ISO/IEC Guide 65 among the staff of the Standards Conformity Division, who shall implement and operate a product certification scheme complying with ISO/IEC Guide 65.

Audit / Gap Analysis (21-23 August 2002)

- This Gap Analysis was very important to the Standards Conformity Division to identify areas for improvement on its operation of the Philippine Standard (PS) Quality and/or Safety Certification Scheme relative to the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65. The results of the Gap Analysis would determine the level of compliance of the PS Scheme to the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65.

Conduct of Course

The conduct of the course by Mr Brett Abraham was very satisfactory. The course was conducted in English, which is the business language of the Philippines. Mr Abraham conducted the course in a professional and very efficient manner. He was able to convey clearly the intent of the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65.

Acceptability of Trainer

Mr Abraham instantly established a good working relationship with the participants of the course. In this way, the participants could freely interact with Mr. Abraham, should there any query or clarification arise.

Value of the course to the participants

The course was very important and relevant to the participants considering that it is imperative for us to operate the PS Product Certification Scheme in accordance to ISO/IEC Guide 65, to enable us to participate in the APEC MLA in Product Certification.

Component 1 – Mexico – 24 to 28 June, 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

The training course on ISO/IEC GUIDE 65 was presented in Mexico City, at the offices of DGN. The program was coordinated by Mr. Jorge Eduardo Lopez, DGN. The presenter was Keith Murfin, Standards Council of Canada (SCC). Twelve (12) attendees represented 6 product Certification Bodies (CB) that are accredited by EMA.

The course focused on the clauses of Guide 65 stressing those points that must be incorporated into the essential documentation of the CB, such as Policies, Quality Manual, procedures, instructions, contracts, license agreements. In addition, certain general concepts were presented that dealt with Quality Management, the various stakeholders, areas of continual improvement, benefits of quality, and the costs of quality and non-quality.

The Guide 65 session was conducted in Spanish, with the help of simultaneous translation (Spanish-to-English as well as English-to-Spanish). Throughout the presentation, the CBs took turns at reading clauses of the Guide, formulating audit-style questions, and evaluating the answers from the other CBs. Discussions followed that enabled all CBs to expand their understanding of the requirements of the Guide.

Participants were mostly new to their roles in the various functions of running product certification programs, such as auditing, formulating procedures, and dealing with problems leading from misuse of their marks. Moreover, most participants had never met each other before, and this training session gave them the opportunity to compare the various understandings and methods of deployment of their Guide 65-based product certification systems.

Results

The feedback received in the form of two (2) course evaluation questionnaires was very positive indeed, and contained many suggestions for future consideration. Some comments suggested that more CBs should have been invited, and that the future facilities should include for table-top settings to facilitate note-taking.

Conclusions and Recommendations

- The advance planning of this event was somewhat late incomplete, which may have contributed to the lower than expected attendance, as it appeared that only half of the CBs in Mexico were represented.
- The APEC "contract" with SCC was received too late by SCC to effect correction and processing, although this was resolved afterwards.

- Several ISO/IEC Guides are not yet available in Spanish. However, it is assumed that upcoming revisions of the Guides will be translated. These Guides will be needed to enable Mexico's CBs to fully appreciate the context within which they operate.
- Continuing involvement and development at DGN and EMA. It may be noted that no contact was made to or from EMA throughout this particular training program. EMA's assistance could have enabled a better attendance by advising more of their accredited CBs of this Guide 65 training opportunity.
- When seeking feedback information from participants, APEC questionnaires could perhaps be in the language of the participants (Spanish).

Report prepared by

Keith Murfin
Senior Program Officer
Certification Branch
Standards Council of Canada

Component 1 – Mexico – 24 to 28 June, 2002

Participants' Report on Completion of Project

Relevance

The course answered to needs to obtain a uniform guide about interpretation of the dispositions of the standards.

Course Development

The course was developed with fluidity and with a lot of participation from the students. Working groups were created and the participants worked in an interactive way.

Trainer

The trainer showed to be in command of the subject and experienced in the application of the standards. He contributed a lot of information to the participants.

Value

The value of the course to the participants is better understand of ISO-65 and its implementation in their organizations, and increase in the correct knowledge and evidence of operation of the standards in study.

Report Prepared by
Heberto Rivera

Participants List

Marina Alvarez Cisneros	COFOCALEC
Patricia Rodriguez Illescas	COFOCALEC
Hugo Ramos Ramos	NORMEX
Emma Morado Martinez	EMA
Veronica Perez Cortez	
Claudia Luisa Cortez Yong	
Mireya Velazquez Florez	ANCE
Arg. Nilda Leonor Sanchez Morales	
Ma. De. Lourdez Gonzalez Valencia	NORMEX
Ing. Cesar Rojas	ANCE
Gerardo Carmona Vasquez	
Azucena Tacuba Moreno	SGS

Component 1 – Indonesia – 20 – 24 May, 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

This report briefly outlines the component 1 training provided in Indonesia to certification bodies identified by KAN-BSN as ones seeking accreditation for product certification in accordance with relevant International Accreditation Forum guidance and the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65, General requirements for bodies operating product certification systems.

The focus of the training was to provide certification body representatives with sufficient training to establish product certification systems that meet IAF and PAC accreditation requirements as detailed in ISO/IEC Guide 61, General requirements for assessment and accreditation of certification/registration bodies.

The feedback from the participants has already been forwarded to the Project Coordinator, and this feedback indicates that the training was indeed very effective and should contribute significantly to the development of accredited certification that meets the international standards, and as a result, facilitate trade in the APEC region.

Report Prepared by

Brett Abraham
JAS-ANZ
Trainer

Component 1 – Indonesia – 20 to 24 May, 2002

Participants' Report on Completion of Project

The training was conducted by KAN-BSN on 20-24 May 2002 with Mr. Brett Abraham from JAS-ANZ as instructor. 37 personnel from product certification bodies, including KAN auditors have participated in the training.

Participants were divided into two groups and the course duration for each group was 2 days. On the last day the two groups together participated actively in discussions.

Generally, the conducting of training course was satisfactory. The following is our evaluation of the APEC training course:

- Relevance of the course content is good.
- Conducting of the course is fair
- Acceptability of the trainer is good
- Value of the course to the participants is good
- Course notes are fair
- Student reading materials are good
- Exercises are fair
- Facilities are good

Report prepared by:

Suprpto
Executive Senior of KAN
for CB's Accreditation

List of Participants for Component 1 Training - Indonesia

Name	Institution
Putra Dwiandoko	LS Pr UB JTK,
Ir. Dhiah Nuraini	BBIHP
Ir. James J. Apituley	PT Mutu Agung Lestari
Ir. Nuryetti	LS Produk Lampung Balai Industri Tanjungkarang
Dra. Tri Hanurawati	LS Produk Lampung Balai Industri Tanjungkarang
Agung Prawoto	M-Brio Organic & Food Labelling
Achyar Rais	LS Pro PPMB
Ir. Rochmi Widjajanti	PUSTAN Depperindag
Priyono	B4T
M. Endang Titiek Widyaningsih	BB Litbang Industri Barang Kulit, Karet & Plast,
Ir. Gusti Anindita Laksamana	Ditjen Postel
Suminto	Pusat ALS - BSN
Suryadi	Pusat ALS - BSN
Kony Sagala	Pusat ALS - BSN
Andry R. Prihikmat	Pusat ALS- BSN
Zul Amri	Pusat ALS- BSN
Rista Aristiteka	Pusat ALS- BSN
Ir. Sunyoto	BSN
Haryo Witjaksono	LS Pr UB JTK
Ir. Kasturi Yuni M	LS Pr UB JTK
Ir. Shirley Simatupang	Postel
Ir. Mulyadi	Postel
Ir.Nirwana Aprianita	BPIHP
Maman Sukmana	PT Mutu Agung
Ir. Untung Prayudie	LS Produk Lampung Balai Industri Tanjungkarang
Ir Zulkifli	LS Produk Lampung Balai Industri Tanjungkarang
Ir. Hernawan	Balai Besar Industri Keramik
Triyan Aidilfitri	PT Sucofindo

List of Participants for Component 1 Training – Indonesia – cont.

Ir. Sutrisno Koswara	M-Brio Organic & Food Labelling
Gilang Priyadi	PUSTAN Depperindag
Drs. Bambang H.H.	BSN
Dra Yommi Rumza	Pusat ALS-BSN
Ir. Tom Abbel Sulendro	Pusat ALS- BSN
Ir. Masgunarto	STT-PLN
Ir. Sriati Djaprie	UNAS
Triningsih Herlinawati	Pusat ALS-BSN

Component 1 – Korea – 1 to 5 October, 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

Mr Brett Abraham visited Korea and provided the Component 1 training from 14 to 18 October as a guest of KAS, the Accreditation Body responsible for accreditation of product certification in Korea, and KOTRIC, the Korean Testing and Research Institute for the Chemical Industry. KAS kindly organised the training facilities and invited the participants to attend; also arranging copies of the course overheads, standards and other reference documents.

KOTRIC has issued product certification to over 700 companies under their 'Q-mark' scheme, and over 70 companies under their 'S-mark' scheme.

In response to KAS and KOTRIC's requests, the training was presented to about twenty (20) technical staff.

The training was structured in two parts:

- Days 1 - 3 Training / seminar (using sequential translation)
- Days 4 and 5 General consultancy/training for KOTRIC on the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65, including how it could be applied for HACCP schemes.

Participant's comments on the Project

The participants filled out a total of seventeen (17) APEC evaluation forms. These were posted to Ms B Mort at the PAC Secretariat as requested. Perusal of the evaluation forms will show that the participants were very pleased with the structure and content of the training as reflected in the group's average overall rating of the project was 4.94 out of 5.

Presenter's comments on the Project

- Course facilities were certainly adequate for the exercise.
- Participants attending participated actively in the course, asking many questions and clearly enjoying the group exercises (workshops). This contributed greatly to the success of the course.

The APEC Secretariat is encouraged to ensure:

- prompt payment of monies owed under the contract;
- more reasonable expectations in terms of evidence of travel and expenses; and
- that future contracts include all reporting expectations.

Mr Brett Abraham
JAS-ANZ
Course Presenter

Component 1 – Korea – 1 to 5 October, 2002

Participants' Report on Completion of Project

First of all, I should thank PAC as well as APEC for the arrangement of this course.

The participants were from KAS (Korea Accreditation System), the accreditation body responsible for product certification in Korea, and KOTRIC (Korean Testing and Research Institute for the Chemical Industry). KOTRIC has issued product certification to over 700 companies under their 'Q-mark' scheme, and over 70 companies under their 'S-mark' scheme.

The course helped KOTRIC and the assessors of KAS understand ISO/IEC Guide 65:1996, General requirements for bodies operating product certification systems, as well as the International Accreditation Forum Guidance on the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65.

KAS supplied a translator to provide sequential translation for the training course. KOTRIC supplied a translator for the final two days of this MLA Readiness Project.

The training was presented to the staff as follows:

- Days 1 - 3 : Training / seminar
- Days 4 and 5 : General consultancy/training for KOTRIC on the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65, including how it could be applied for HACCP schemes.

44 Personnel has attended for the course.

- 24 assessors all from KAS (Korea Accreditation System)
- 20 Personnel from KOTRIC

The course was quite fit for the purpose including facilitation of mutual recognition requirements. The course was quite impressive and especially the knowledge of course provider, Brett Abraham, was more than adequate to advise everything to all course attendants.

Component 1 – Thailand - 29 July to 2 August, 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

Mr Brett Abraham visited Thailand and provided the Component 1 training from 29 July to 2 August as a guest of the Thai Industrial Standards Institute. TISI kindly organised the training facilities and invited the participants to attend; also arranging copies of the course overheads, standards and other reference documents. TISI is the National Product Certification body responsible for product certification in accordance with the Thai Industrial Product Standards Act. TISI has been providing product certification for approximately 30 years, and has created three specialist bureaus for this purpose. These are:

- Standards Bureau 1, which is mainly responsible for certification of construction materials, has 82 staff and has issued around 2,200 certificates to date.
- Standards Bureau 2, which is mainly responsible for certification of electrical, electronic and automobile products, has 86 staff and has issued around 5,400 certificates to date.
- Standards Bureau 3, which is mainly responsible for certification of chemicals, food, textiles, medical devices and others miscellaneous products, has 80 staff, and has issued around 2,600 certificates to date.

The Standards Bureau's have implemented product certification management systems. Given the advanced state of the existing product certification infrastructure, TISI requested that the Component 1 training be presented as an accreditation assessment structured along the lines of a gap analysis with regular interactive intervals. The training program focussed on Standards Bureau 2, with observers in attendance from Standards Bureaus 1 and 3.

TISI provided twenty (20) technical staff to attend as observers and participants in the gap analysis/training session.

Presenter's comments on the Project

- The facilities were adequate for the exercise.
- Participant's attending the gap analysis interacted actively throughout the five days, asking many questions and clearly enjoying the group exercises (workshops). This contributed greatly to the success of the course.

The APEC Secretariat is encouraged to ensure:

- prompt payment of monies owed under the contract;
- more reasonable expectations in terms of evidence of travel and expenses; and
- that future contracts include all reporting expectations.

Mr Brett Abraham
JAS-ANZ
Course Presenter

	APEC Project No: CTI 29/2001T Multilateral Recognition Arrangement (MLA) Readiness Project in Product Certification	
--	---	--

Component 1 – Thailand - 29 July to 2 August, 2002

Participant’s Report on Completion of Project

The training was provided to Thai Industrial Standards Institute (TISI) in the period 29 July 2002.

There was only one participant - Mr Virat Aja-Apisit.

The training course was in the form of a pre-assessment of the Thai Standards Bureau 1,2,3 which is the main product certification body in Thailand. The project was under the supervision of Mr Virat of Standards Bureau 2.

Mr Virat’s participants’ survey indicated the following:

- | | | |
|---|-------------------------------|--|
| • | How has economy benefited | good |
| • | New skills learnt | knowledge in Guide 65 and IAF guidance |
| • | Proposed changes in economy | none, but some improvements |
| • | What next | use the audit findings to improve system |
| • | Linking the project’s outcome | none |
| • | Rating out of 5 | 4 |
| • | Effectiveness of the project | 4 |
| • | Project content | just right |

Report prepared by
Ekanit Romyanon
NAC Thailand

Component 1 - Vietnam – 4 to 9 November, 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

Mr Phua Kim Chua of the Singapore Accreditation Council visited Vietnam Certification Services (QUACERT), STAMEQ, Vietnam from 4 to 9 November 2002. QUACERT, a division of STAMEQ, is the national certification body in Vietnam.

The project covered the review of QUACERT's Quality Manual and Procedures for the operation of its Product Certification Scheme, review of a certified company's file, discussion of findings of the review, and identify areas for follow up. In addition, a workshop on ISO/IEC Guide 65 was conducted. Participants at the workshop were mainly QUACERT's auditors. The entire duration of the project was 5 days.

Participants' Comments On The Workshop

- A total of 13 participants attended the workshop. A QUACERT staff member was the interpreter for the workshop.
- At the end of the workshop, the participants were requested to complete the APEC evaluation form (Annex F1, Part B). The trainer also completed an APEC questionnaire (Annex F1, Part A). The completed questionnaires were sent to the Project Coordinator.
- A review of the questionnaires showed that the workshop was well received by the participants. They found the workshop beneficial and useful.

Review Of QUACERT's Quality Manual And Procedures

The review of QUACERT's Quality Manual and Procedures showed that they were well documented. Some areas for improvement were identified for follow up.

Review Of Certified Company's File

As requested by QUACERT, one of the certified company's file was reviewed. An area of concern was raised regarding the maximum range of the product certified, which exceeded the maximum allowable for the size of the sample tested. Some other areas for improvement were also highlighted for follow up.

Trainer's Comments On The Project

- The course facilities were adequate for the training.
- Participants showed keen interest to understand the requirements of Guide 65. They also participated actively in the course, asking questions and playing an active role in the group exercises. This contributed greatly to the success of the workshop.
- The project has met its objectives. QUACERT has a better understanding of Guide 65 requirements, and can take steps to improve its product certification scheme.

	APEC Project No: CTI 29/2001T Multilateral Recognition Arrangement (MLA) Readiness Project in Product Certification	
--	---	--

APEC Secretariat needs to improve its service in relation to:

- Provide a quick response to confirmation on the proposed project
- The types of report required to be submitted by trainers have to be clearly made known before the start of the project.



Phua Kim Chua
Singapore Accreditation Council

Component 1 - Vietnam – 4 to 9 November, 2002

Participant's Report on Completion of Project

Conduct of the Course

- The course was conducted from 4 – 9 November 2002, with QUACERT as the host certification body.
- 14 people from 4 different bodies participated in the training
- The first two days were spent in reviewing our quality manual, procedures and instructions.
- The next two days comprised a workshop on ISO/IEC Guide 65.
- The final day was again spent reviewing procedures, commenting and reporting.

Relevance of Course Content

- The course content was good and relevant to our situation, because we can improve our recent system and understand deeply about ISO/IEC Guide 65.

Acceptability Of The Trainer

- The trainer, Mr Phua Kim Chua of SAC Singapore, was good.

Value Of The Course To The Participants

- The course was successful and of great benefit to the participants.

Report Prepared by
Tran Van Vinh
QUACERT

List of Participants

Nguyen Nam Hai - QUACERT;
Nguyen Thi Minh Ly - QUACERT
Nguyen Quang Dung - QUACERT
Tran Quoc Dung - QUACERT
Tran Quoc Quan - QUACERT
Trinh Hong Minh - QUACERT
Nguyen Ngoc Ly - QUACERT
Tran Quang Chu - QUACERT
Tran Xuan Giap - QUACERT
Nguyen Xuan Khoi - VPC
Nguyen Van Kim - VPC
Pham Duc Uy - DucAnh
Bui Cao Vu - QUATEST1
Nghuyen Xuan Kien - QUATEST1.

COMPONENT 2

TRAINING FOR ACCREDITORS OF PRODUCT CERTIFICATION BODIES

Description of the Project

Purpose

The purpose of the component 2 training was to provide assistance to developing accreditors of product certification bodies in APEC member economies, to enable them to accredit product certification bodies in accordance with ISO/IEC Guide 61. This was achieved by provision of experts to identified product certification bodies for 5 days of intensive training.

Participants

Funding was received for 7 participants under this component. The following 4 APEC member economies participated in Component 1

- Vietnam
- Malaysia
- Mexico
- Singapore

Russia was approached to participate, however they declined. Peru and Chile were approached on several occasions and failed to respond.

All of the training has been undertaken at 12 November 2002. The following pages provide reports from the trainers and some of the participant certification bodies on each individual course.

Component 2 – Vietnam – 14 to 19 October, 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

Introduction

Mr Phua Kim Chua of the Singapore Accreditation Council visited the Bureau of Accreditation (BoA), STAMEQ, Vietnam from 14 to 19 October 2002 under the APEC Project No. CTI 29/2001T, Component 2. BoA, a division of STAMEQ, is the national accreditation body in Vietnam.

The project covered the review of BoA's Quality Manual and Procedures for the Operation of an Accreditation Scheme for Product Certification Bodies, discussion of findings of the review with BoA, and identifying areas for follow up. In addition a workshop on ISO/IEC Guide 65 for accreditation assessors and certification bodies' auditors was conducted. The entire duration of the project was 5 days.

Participants' Comments On The Workshop

A total of 18 participants attended the workshop. At the end of the workshop, the participants were requested to complete the APEC evaluation form (Annex F1, Part B). The trainer also completed an APEC questionnaire (Annex F1, Part A). The completed questionnaires were sent to Ms Belinda Mort by airmail on 5 November 2002. A review of the questionnaires showed that the workshop was well received by the participants. They found the workshop beneficial and useful.

Review Of BoA's Quality Manual And Procedures

The review of BoA's Quality Manual and Procedures showed that the documents need to be further improved in order for BoA to introduce an accreditation scheme for product certification bodies. An important area that requires follow up is the setting up of the Advisory Boards. The composition of the Advisory Boards have to be specially selected to ensure that major interests groups participate while ensuring impartiality and balance of interest. In addition, terms of reference of the Boards have to be developed. Areas for improvement of other procedures were also highlighted for follow up. BoA found the session useful.

Trainer's Comments On The Project

- The course facilities were adequate for the training.
- Participants showed keen interest to understand the requirements of Guide 65. They also participated actively in the course, asking questions and playing an active role in the group exercises. This contributed greatly to the success of the workshop.
- The project has met its objectives. BoA has a better understanding of Guide 65 requirements, and is in a better position to introduce an accreditation scheme for product certification bodies

The trainer feels that the APEC Secretariat needs to improve its service in relation to:

- Provide a quick response to confirmation on the proposed project
- The types of report required to be submitted by trainers have to be clearly made known before the start of the project.



Phua Kim Chua
Singapore Accreditation Council (SAC)
Course Presenter

Component 2 – Vietnam – 14 to 19 October, 2002

Participants' Report on Completion of Project

Mr Phua ran a very good course on Guide 65. Here are some my specific comments:

Conduct of the Course

- The conduct of the course was good. A lot of workshop was introduced that make the training more interesting, useful and practical to the participants.

Relevance of CourseContent

- The content of the course is quite comprehensive. All requirements of Guide 65 were addressed. Besides relevant standards were also introduced such as ISO/IEC Guide 61; Guide 23; Guide 27.

Acceptability of the Trainer

- The trainer was quite friendly. However his accent was a little bit too fast and difficult for participants to understand. However we provided the translation to the course.

Value Of The Course To The Participants

- I think the course is value for participants. All they got more knowledge of the G65 and a lot of participants need the knowledge for their jobs. They are some ones from CBs who are setting up the product programs; or they come from regulators who do some compulsory product certification and monitor the activities

On this occasion I would like to thanks APEC and PAC and yourself for the important assistance to accreditation activities in Vietnam .

Vu Thuy
Deputy Director
Bureau of Accreditation
Vietnam

	APEC Project No: CTI 29/2001T Multilateral Recognition Arrangement (MLA) Readiness Project in Product Certification	
--	---	--

**List of Participants on the APEC Workshop on Guide 65
Hanoi 16 – 17/10/2002**

Name	Organisation
Nguyen Thi Mai Huong	General Affairs and Legislation Dept- STAMEQ
Nghiem Thanh Hai	General Affairs and Legislation Dept- STAMEQ
Nguyen Thi Thu	General Affairs and Legislation Dept- STAMEQ
Nguyen Thu Giang	General Affairs and Legislation Dept- STAMEQ
Nguyen Kim Vinh	Quality Management Services (QMS)
Nguyen Thi Mai Anh	Quality Management Services (QMS)
Dinh Thi Thanh Hoa	Quality Management Services (QMS)
Dang Tuan Hung	Quatest 1, STAMEQ
Bui Anh Tuyen	Quatest 1, STAMEQ
Nguyen Quoc Long	Quatest 1, STAMEQ
Nguyen Quang Tam	Quatest 1, STAMEQ
Sai Vinh Suong	Bacninh Dept for Standardization Metrology and Quality Control
Vu Xuan Thuy	Bureau of Accreditation, STAMEQ
Nguyen Anh Tuan	Bureau of Accreditation, STAMEQ
Pham Thanh Huyen	Bureau of Accreditation, STAMEQ
Tran Thanh Nga	Bureau of Accreditation, STAMEQ
Tran Thu Ha	Bureau of Accreditation, STAMEQ
Hoang Dinh Dien	Bureau of Accreditation, STAMEQ
Tran Duc Thai	Thainguyen Dept for Standardization Metrology and Quality Control
Dao Quan Giam	Dongnai Dept for Standardization Metrology and Quality Control

Component 2 – Malaysia – 2 to 6 September, 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

Mr Brett Abraham visited Malaysia and provided the Component 1 training from 2 to 6 September as a guest of DSM, the accreditation body to be responsible for accreditation of certification bodies offering product certification in Malaysia. DSM kindly organised the training facilities and invited the participants to attend; also arranging copies of the course overheads, standards and other reference documents.

DSM provides certification for a wide range of products (mechanical, construction materials, chemical, food product, electrical and electronic, fire protection equipment etc). SIRIM's quality manuals and procedures are aligned to Guide 65, but have not to date been audited by a third party.

The training was presented to eighteen (18) technical staff.

DSM requested the following training structure for this assistance:

- 2-3 September, Guide 65 Training / seminar.
- 4-5 September, Audit/Gap Analysis against the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 61 and Guide 65.
- 6 September, Closing meeting, discussions on findings followed by Q&A.

Participants' comments on the Project

The participants completed a total of sixteen (16) APEC evaluation forms. These were posted to Ms B Mort at the PAC Secretariat as requested. Perusal of the evaluation forms will show that the participants were very pleased with the structure and content of the training as reflected in the group's average overall rating of the project was 4.6 out of 5.

Presenter's comments on the Project

Course facilities were certainly adequate for the exercise.

Participants attending participated actively in the course, asking many questions and clearly enjoying the group exercises (workshops). This contributed greatly to the success of the course.

The APEC Secretariat is encouraged to ensure:

- prompt payment of monies owed under the contract;
- more reasonable expectations in terms of evidence of travel and expenses; and
- that future contracts include all reporting expectations.

Mr Brett Abraham
JAS-ANZ
Course Presenter

Component 2 – Malaysia – 2 to 6 September, 2002

Participants' Report on Completion of Project

Guide 65 Training / Seminar (2-3 Sept 2002)

- Attended by 10 contract assessors and 5 permanent DSM staff
- All elements of ISO/IEC Guide 65 and IAF Guidance were discussed with greater emphasis on certain elements like the different types of certification systems, organisations, impartiality, operations. Some elements were not discussed in detail since they were similar to Guide 62 & 66.
- Also discussed were ISO/IEC Guides 7, 23 and 27.
- In every session, participants were given questions to test their understanding of the standard/Guidance and answers were discussed with the trainer. The participants felt that more questions should be posed but due to time constraints, this could not be done.

Conduct Internal Audit/Gap Analysis against the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 61 (4-5 and 6 (am) Sept 2002)

- Attended by 3 permanent DSM staff and 1 contract assessor.
- DSM documents were audited against all requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 61 and IAF Guidance. All shortcomings were highlighted and recommendations to improve the system were proposed.

Closing meeting, discussions on findings followed by Q&A (pm - 6 Sept 2002)

- All findings were explained to DSM management and staff at the meeting. A draft report was submitted. (The final report was received a week later).

Conclusions

Mr Brett Abraham is an excellent trainer who is well versed with all the standards and guidance. His presentation and explanation was easily understood. In fact, we would be very happy if Mr Abraham can conduct other training courses in DSM in the future.

The whole Component 2 Training course has been beneficial to DSM. Besides giving us the opportunity to know more about the requirements of G65, the gap analysis provides us input as to ways to improve our documentation for the management systems.

Report Prepared By
Ms Fadilah Baharin
DSM

Component 2 – Mexico – 10 to 14 June, 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

Monday June 10, 2002 - Witness Assist in a Document Review Session

- Attended (observed) a session of an ema assessment team preparing for a reassessment of a Product Certification Body. The team spent approximately four hours reviewing the documents submitted by the body. The team had the opportunity to discuss some of finer points of the criteria for the program. Approaches and strategies to deal with certification bodies during assessments were discussed. The issue of logistics for the document review was also discussed. It was suggested that there are a number of options to reviewing documents, and likely more in the future with electronic files, to allow more time and flexibility and provide thorough reviews. The appropriate use of technical experts was also discussed, as this is a major issue for product certification programs.
- It was recommended that ema ensure that there is adequate time to perform the document review. One means of providing extra opportunities for the team is to distribute documents before meeting to allow for individual review.
- The balance of the day was use to discuss program issues with ema staff and address logistics for the training session planned later in the week.

Tuesday June 11, 2002 - Witness of the Product Certification Assessment

- Attended as an observer at a ema assessment with a team of two assessors and two technical experts. The assessment was well planned and controlled by the lead assessors. A number of issues arose during the audit that made it difficult to manage the process in discrete sessions.
- As the technical experts were only available for the first day the issues of auditor qualifications and assessment procedures were addressed first. There appeared to be many issues of control and prescription in the design of the product programs examined. These issues ranged from the participation of the appropriate committee members to the formal qualification of auditors and even the basic matter of well structured criteria documents (standards).
- The team seems to have done a good job of identifying these issues but there seems to be some hesitation to request more then what the regulators or producers have established for the programs. Ema may be placing itself in a difficult position, in the future, if they are associated with ineffective programs. Ema may need to consider a strategy where it encourages regulators to partner with them to develop more robust programs.

Wednesday June 12, 2002 - Witness of the Product Certification Assessment

- Continued the attendance as an observer of the ema assessment. The core team, without the aid of technical experts, examined many of the key management elements this day. The assessment team displayed tact and perseverance as they were faced with serious opposition from the certification body. While the certification body attempted a number of intimidation techniques the team held their position while attempting to address the issues in a constructive and positive manner.
- The closing meeting was held with all senior management and concluded with the non-acceptance of a nonconformity. While the team leader attempted to present potential solutions to the impasse the senior management was not responding. There would appear to be a need to strengthen the communications to the Certification Body particularly regarding the clear expectations of the program and the appropriate means to resolve complaints.
- The client appeared to be under the impression that the nonconformity had immediate repercussions with no option of an effective appeal. Such an impression is not constructive for the client or ema and should be addressed. Enhanced communications and information on the program may be able to prevent this type of misunderstanding.
- Provided the team with feedback on the assessment after the closing meeting.

Thursday June 13, 2001 - ema Assessor Workshop

- A workshop session was held in the facilities of ema with the attendance of some eight persons from staff and assessors. The session was designed to review the criteria for accreditation bodies with emphasize on the product certification programs. The first day comprised an introduction exercise followed by discussions on the structure and organization of accreditation bodies.
- The first day of the workshop ended with an exercise to examine different theoretical type of Product Certification programs. The group was asked to discuss the advantages and disadvantages of each, as well as, what kinds of products are the most appropriate for these programs.

Friday June 14, 2002 - ema Assessor Workshop

- The workshop session continued into the more operational issues of accreditation programs. The topics covered included the management and qualification of accreditation body personnel and the accreditation process with emphasize on the assessment activities that are undertaken.
- The attendants had the opportunity to discuss their experiences and opinions. The issues that arose during the activities observed earlier in the week provided some examples for interpretation of the criteria. The workshop was concluded with a review set of questions that were answered as a group and encourage more discussion.

Joan Brough-Kerrebyn
Quality Manager
Standards Council of Canada
Course Presenter

Component 2 – Mexico – 10 to 14 June, 2002

Participants' Report on Completion of Project

Summary Conclusions:

- The course led us to strengthen the knowledge for accreditation of product certification bodies. We think that this kind of project can help to align the schemes for accreditation processes according to ISO/IEC 61.
- The workshop session helped to discuss our experiences in the product program and talk about the interpretation for every issue included in ISO/IEC 61 and ISO/IEC 65. We had the opportunity to review the different theoretical type of product certification programs.
- We are very satisfied with the work of the trainer, who was observing a session of an ema assessment team preparing a reassessment for a product CB and was also observing the assessment. We received a very complete report from Joan Brough-Kerrebyn about the process that she was observing and her impressions of the workshop.

The conclusion from the participants:

- The workshop was excellent and profitable
- Thanks for the opportunity to learn with the experience and knowledge of the trainer.
- This kind of project helps to strengthen the conformity assessment processes.

Araceli Suárez
Senior Manager CB
ema

List of Participants

Yolanda Silvia Carmona Quiroz
Jose Luis Martínez Tafolla
Vicente Ramírez Ibañez
Alva Flabia Salas Lemus
Arturo Luna Torers
Jacob García Colín
Araceli Suárez

Component 2 – Singapore – 20 to 24 May, 2002

Trainer's Report on Completion of Project

I undertook a training programme in Singapore, which broadly covered the following:

- 20 May - In class workshop attended by 24 individuals from both SAC and CBs on ISO/IEC Guide 65 and associated IAF Guidance.
- 21 to 24 May - Lead a SAC audit team for the first product audit. The team consisted of one SAC auditor and two SAC observers. The audit consisted of two days office audit and two days witnessing.

From the course evaluation forms received from the participants, I would have to say that the course was successful and effective. The only criticism was that the course was too short.

The audit was also successful however the overall audit has not been completed, as nonconformities need to be closed.

Steve Keeling
Director Operations
JAS-ANZ
Course Presenter

Component 2 – Singapore – 20 to 24 May, 2002

Participants' Report on Completion of Project

Introduction

Mr Steve Keeling of JAS-ANZ provided training from 20 – 24 May 2002. The training took the form of a one day workshop, followed by on-the-job training at a 4 day audit of a product certification body.

Benefits

- SAC assessors and some auditors of certification bodies have been trained on the requirements of ISO/IEC Guide 65
- SAC assessors have a better understanding of Guide 65 requirements and learn how to conduct accreditation assessments to Guide 65
- SAC quality documentation and SAC accreditation assessments of product certification bodies will be improved as a result of the training
- SAC will encourage more product certification bodies to obtain accreditation. With the training, SAC assessors would fine tune and improve their techniques for assessing certification bodies
- SAC will work towards achieving the PAC MLA in this area

Assessment of the Project

- The course content was good
- The project was assessed as being very effective



Phua Kim Chua
Singapore Accreditation Council (SAC)
Course Presenter

CONCLUSIONS

Objectives

The project met all its objectives

- **Component 1**
 - Training provided to certification bodies from 9 APEC member economies.
 - A total of 132 (add in Malaysia and Korea) individuals from more than 40 different organizations attended the training.
- **Component 2**
 - Training provided to 65 staff from 4 accreditation bodies in APEC member economies. One of these (Mexico) has since applied to join the PAC MLA for Product and the other 3 have indicated their intention to apply.

Timeliness

Components 1 and 2 have been completed on time. Completion of Component 3 has been delayed until September 2003, with the permission of the APEC SCSC.

Budget

Components 1 and 2 have been completed with budget.

Problems

The major problem experienced to date has been the implementation of Component 3 training. After the program commenced, comments were received from many of the participants that it would be impossible to nominate candidates to undertake Component 3 training, until after the completion of Components 1 and 2. The first two components would assist participating accreditation bodies in determining their readiness to apply for membership of the PAC MLA, providing training opportunities under Component 3.

Accordingly, the Project Overseer applied to APEC SCSC for an extension of Component 3 to September 2003, which was granted.

Gender Considerations

- The project was designed to enhance the capability of product certification and accreditation bodies of APEC member economies.
- Women were actively involved in the conceptualisation and development of the project.
- Women were also encouraged to provide training services for the project, however due to other commitments, only one training course was presented by a woman.
- Participation of women in the project itself was encouraged, and training was provided to all women who held relevant positions within the organisations receiving training.

Dissemination of Project Output

All trainees received relevant training materials and course notes as applicable.

This report will be distributed by the Project Coordinator to:

- the organising body in each APEC member economy, for forwarding on to the participants.
- all trainers, so that they can assess their course content and methodology against the other trainers.
- all PAC members for information.

It is envisaged that this report will be distributed by APEC Secretariat to all APEC members.

Training materials developed for this course will be freely available to all PAC members upon request, whether they participated in the training or not.



Belinda Mort
Project Coordinator

14 November, 2002