

ANNEX 1 OUTCOMES STATEMENT

Developing effective public-private partnerships: meeting the needs of the 21st century workforce symposium

11–13 August 2008

APEC Secretariat, Singapore

The Developing Effective Public-Private Partnerships: Meeting the Needs of the 21st Century Global Workforce symposium was held 11–13 August 2008 at the APEC Secretariat in Singapore. The symposium was co-hosted by the Australian Government Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations (DEEWR) and the United States Department of Labor (USDOL).

The symposium is part of a two-year USDOL APEC project, *Ensuring Sustainable Growth in the 21st Century through Workforce Development* and was endorsed by the Labour and Social Protection Network of the APEC Human Resources Development Working Group (HRDWG). The symposium incorporated issues identified in an Australian DEEWR self-funded project which examines the use of public-private partnerships (PPPs) in the delivery of labour market and welfare policies and programs in APEC economies.

The symposium was opened by the Executive Director of the APEC Secretariat, Ambassador Juan Capuñay of Peru, who spoke about the importance of incorporating PPPs in strategies for meeting skills and labour shortages and in the delivery of employment and training services, which aligns with APEC and Peru's priorities for 2008.

Forty-five delegates attended the symposium representing 17 APEC member economies. The economies represented were Australia, Brunei Darussalam, Canada, Chile, People's Republic of China, Indonesia, Japan, Republic of Korea, Malaysia, Mexico, New Zealand, Peru, Republic of the Philippines, Singapore, Chinese Taipei, Thailand and the United States. There was broad representation of participants from government, industry, international organisations, academia and the not-for-profit sector.

The symposium provided an opportunity to explore different models of PPPs in the delivery of labour market

and employment programs through the experiences and perspectives of varying economies and partners.

The 16 case studies presented provided a variety of approaches to addressing skills shortages, delivering employment and training services, and developing labour market information through PPPs to address the different needs and circumstances of APEC member economies.

Some key themes shared by economies through their experience with PPPs emerged from the symposium.

1. PPPs are essential to the APEC region, as they are an important tool in achieving sustainable development and in the promotion of businesses of all sizes, from micro-enterprises to larger companies.
2. Utilising existing regional strengths through PPPs can assist in meeting the needs of the 21st century global workforce.
3. Human capital serves a critical role in economic development, as a skilled workforce is a main driver of business recruitment, retention, and expansion.
4. It is essential to develop effective human resource practices in order to build capacity and enhance the capability of PPPs.
5. A skilled and adequate workforce is an important component of liberalised markets.
6. PPPs are an effective mechanism in providing much needed goods and services.
7. Efficiency, productivity and successful outcomes can be increased by partnering public and private sector expertise and resources.
8. PPPs can be an important mechanism for identifying and addressing the mismatch between the demand and supply of skilled labour.
9. The most effective role for government in public-private partnerships, whether as the lead of the partnership or in a supporting role, depends on the unique circumstances in the APEC economy and the workforce challenge being addressed.
10. Building strong relationships with the private sector and other relevant stakeholders can help governments better address the social dimension of globalisation.

11. While government and business are often the primary focus of PPPs, educational institutions and civil society are also critical partners in human resource development.
12. There is value in public-private collaboration—both in preparing for future workforce challenges and in creating the relationships necessary for sustaining human resource development strategies.
13. Evaluation is an important tool for identifying best practices in PPPs.
14. The increase in utilisation of PPPs for human resource development reflects the recognition that no single entity, or any one sector, can respond adequately or comprehensively enough to the workforce challenges posed by the competitive global economy.

Next Steps

- Finalise and distribute the report on *Developing Effective Public-Private Partnerships in the APEC Region* to wider APEC audience, including publishing report on APEC and HRDWG websites.
- Consider developing, supporting, and promoting APEC project proposals that build on the outcomes of the PPP project and symposium.
- Seek further support from Leaders and Senior Officials for promoting the development of PPPs in the field of human resource development.

ANNEX 2

TERMS OF REFERENCE

APEC Self-Funded Project—Developing Effective Public-Private Partnerships in the APEC Region

The private sector has long provided goods and services to the public sector. A trend seems to be developing in a number of countries towards an increase in the use of Public-Private Partnerships for the provision of services traditionally delivered by the public sector. Research has revealed a number of reasons why governments are attracted to such partnerships, including value for money, gains from innovation and access to improved services.

The project aims to investigate the use of Public-Private Partnerships in the APEC region and identify good practice examples by member economies in relation to labour and social protection policies and programs.

When defining a Public-Private Partnership for the purposes of the project, it refers to an arrangement or agreement between the public and private sectors that:

- is employment focussed;
- delivers employment and/or welfare services;
- involves sharing information to develop labour market strategies;
- utilises each sector's expertise in order to increase workforce participation;
- improves the skills of workers to assist them to find employment and increase their value in the workforce; or
- seeks to respond to both supply and/or demand labour market conditions.

The project will explore the full extent of Public-Private Partnerships in order to determine key characteristics and highlight valuable case studies. The range of partnerships to be explored may include, but is not limited to: information sharing arrangements; cooperative or complimentary service models; and competitive labour market models.

Although the focus of the project is on Public-Private Partnership use in the APEC region, research into countries beyond the region may also be useful in developing concepts and drawing conclusions. The work of other regional bodies and multilateral organisations may also be beneficial.

The results of any research undertaken during the project shall be disseminated to APEC economies in order to assist them in developing effective employment strategies. It is preferable that any data provided is comparable across economies (where possible) and that any written material will be easily understood by all members. The research should also highlight any areas beyond the scope of the project that may form the basis for a future APEC exploration.

END NOTES

- ¹ 12th APEC Economic Leaders' Meeting—The Santiago Declaration "ONE COMMUNITY, OUR FUTURE" Santiago de Chile 20–21 November 2004
- ² APEC's Agenda for 2008: A New Commitment to Asia-Pacific Development. APEC E-Newsletter, Vol. 15, January 2008
- ³ J Teicher *et al*, 'Managing Trust and Relationships in PPPs: Some Australian Experiences', *School of Management Working Paper Series*, Victoria University, Australia, 2005
- ⁴ MinterEllison Lawyers, *Public-Private Partnerships*, MinterEllison Lawyers, 2007
- ⁵ L English & J Guthrie, 'Driving Privately Financed Projects in Australia: What Makes them Tick?', *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, vol.16, no.3, 2003
- ⁶ E Webster & G Harding, 'Outsourcing Public Employment Services: The Australian Experience', *The Australian Economic Review*, vol.34, no.2, 2001
- ⁷ M Geddes, *Making Public Private Partnerships Work: Building Relationships and Understanding Cultures*, Gower Publishing, United Kingdom, 2005
- ⁸ J-P Barbier *et al*, 'Public-Private Partnerships in Employment Services', *International Labor Organisation Working Paper*, 2003
- ⁹ M H More, *Creating Public Value Through Private/Public Partnerships*, Harvard University, USA, 2005
- ¹⁰ J-P Barbier *et al*, 'Public-Private Partnerships in Employment Services', *International Labor Organisation Working Paper*, 2003
- ¹¹ Australian Industry Group, *Strategic Training Partnerships Between the State and Enterprises*, AIGroup, Australia, 2007, www.getatrade.gov.au/documents/Regional_Skills/Casestudies1.pdf. Viewed 30 June 2008
- ¹² Alliance of Sector Councils, *TASC Fact Sheet: Skill Shortages in Key Sectors*, TASC, Canada, 2006, www.councils.org. viewed 21 June 2008
- ¹³ Human Resources and Social Development Canada, *Sector Council Program: Program Information*, Government of Canada, 2008, www.hrsdc.gc.ca/en/workplaceskills/sector_councils/information.shtml. viewed 18 June 2008
- ¹⁴ Economic Planning Unit, *The Second Outline Perspective Plan 1990–2000: Human Resource Development*, Prime Minister's Department, Government of Malaysia, 1990, www.epu.jpm.my. viewed 1 July 2008
- ¹⁵ S Foong & B Somchit, 'Penang, Malaysia: A Smart Public-Private Partnership: An Example of a Government-led Initiative', *Saigon Hi-Tech Park News*, 8 August 2007, www.shtp.hochiminhcity.gov.vn/webshtp/news/content.aspx?cat_id=600&news_id=663. viewed 1 July 2008
- ¹⁶ Penang Skill Development Centre (PSDC), *History*, PSDC, Malaysia, 2008, www.psd.com.my/page.cfm?name=Profile-History. viewed 1 July 2008
- ¹⁷ Workforce Development Agency (WDA), *Place and Train Programs: Overview*, WDA, Singapore, 2006, www.wda.gov.sg/Programs/Place_and_Train_Programs/Overview.htm. viewed 18 June 2008
- ¹⁸ Workforce Development Agency, *WDA Annual Report 2006/07*, WDA, Singapore, 2007, www.wda.gov.sg. viewed 18 June 2008
- ¹⁹ Working Group for International Cooperation in Skill Development, 'Skill Development Policies and International Cooperation in East and South-East Asia', *Debates in Skill Development Paper 11*, Network for Policy Research, Review and Advice on Education and Training, Hong Kong, 2007
- ²⁰ P Wongboonsin, 'Skill Training and Workplace Learning', *Thailand Monitor*, 5 July 2007
- ²¹ A Rojvithee, *Skill Development Strategies Powerpoint Presentation*, Thailand Ministry of Labour, Hong Kong, 2007
- ²² APEC, *Successful Practices in Human Resources Development in the Workplace: Contributions from Labour, Management and Government*, APEC, 1999
- ²³ United States Department of Labor, Employment and Training Administration (ETA), *The President's High Growth Job Training Initiative*, Government of the United States of America, USA, 2007, www.doleta.gov/BRG/JobTrainInitiative. viewed 20 June 2008
- ²⁴ United States Department of Labor Employment and Training Administration (ETA), *The President's*

Community-Based Job Training Grants, Government of the United States of America, USA, 2008, www.doleta.gov/BRG/CBJTGrants. viewed 20 June 2008

²⁵ Berkely Policy Associates, *Evaluation of Generation I of the Workforce Innovation in Regional Economic Development (WIRED) Initiative*, United States Department of Labor, 2008, www.ecolorado.org/File.aspx?ID=32237. viewed 23 June 2008. p.2

²⁶ Y-T Wang *et al*, *Effects of Multi-Employment Promotion Program and their Predictors: An Example of 2004 Multi-Employment Promotion Program*, Taiwan Institute of Social Welfare, 2008

²⁷ Singapore Human Resources Institute (SHRI), *About SHRI*, SHRI, 2008, www.shri.org.sg/_about_shri.asp. viewed 22 July 2008

²⁸ United States Department of Labor, Employment and Training Administration (ETA), *Workforce Investment Act of 1998—Public Law 105-220—August 7 1998*, Government of the United States of America, USA, 1998

²⁹ Urban Institute Center on Labour, Human Services and Population, *Implementation and Sustainability: Emerging Lessons from the Early High Growth Job Training Initiative (HGJI) Grants*, Department of Labor, 2007, United States Department of Labor, USA, 2007, www.urban.org/publications/411556/html. viewed on 20 June 2008. p.11

³⁰ World Bank, 'World Bank Supports Vocational Training in India with US\$280 Million', *Press Release*, World Bank, 5 June 2007

³¹ See www.betterfactories.org

³² International Finance Corporation (IFC), *Building Garment Industry Productivity and Competitiveness in Cambodia*, Mekong Private Sector Development Facility, 2008

³³ See www.betterwork.org/public/global

³⁴ Better Factories Cambodia, *About Better Factories*, Better Factories Cambodia, 2008

³⁵ R Harvey, A Meisling & H Sammari, 'Better Work: Promoting Labour Standards Through Responsible Competitiveness' *Better Work Report*, Better Work, July 2007

³⁶ World Bank, *Defining Civil Society*, World Bank, 2008, www.worldbank.org. viewed 1 July 2008

³⁷ B Crow & S Mozumder, 'World Bank Supports Vocational Training in India with US\$280 Million', *World Bank Press Release*, World Bank, 5 June 2007, www.worldbank.org. viewed 1 July 2008

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC), 12th APEC Economic Leaders' Meeting—The Santiago Declaration "ONE COMMUNITY, OUR FUTURE", Santiago de Chile 20–21 November 2004, APEC
- Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC), 'APEC's Agenda for 2008: A New Commitment to Asia-Pacific Development', APEC E-Newsletter, Vol. 15, January 2008, APEC
- Alliance of Sector Councils, TASC Fact Sheet: Skill Shortages in Key Sectors, TASC, Canada, 2006
- APEC, *Successful Practices in Human Resources Development in the Workplace: Contributions from Labour, Management and Government*, APEC, 1999
- Australian Bureau of Statistics, '6202.0—Labour Force, Australia May 2008', released 12 June 2008, Australian Government
- Australian National Audit Office, 'Administration of Job Network Service Fees', ANAO Audit Report No.38 2007–2008, Australian Government, released June 2008
- Barbier J, Hansen E & Samorodov A, 'Public-Private Partnerships in Employment Services', International Labour Organisation Working Paper, ILO, Geneva, 2003
- Barrett P, Auditing in an Environment of Public/Private Partnership and Great Collaboration in the Provision of Public Services (speech), Australian National Audit Office, Australian Government, 2001
- Berkely Policy Associates, Evaluation of Generation I of the Workforce Innovation in Regional Economic Development (WIRED) Initiative, United States Department of Labor, 2008
- Better Factories Cambodia, 'About Better Factories', Better Factories Cambodia, 2008
- Congress of the United States of America Library, H.R.3734: Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act of 1996 (Enrolled as Agreed to or Passed by Both House and Senate), Congress of the United States of America, 1996
- Crow B & Mozumder S, 'World Bank Supports Vocational Training in India with US\$280 Million', World Bank Press Release, World Bank, 5 June 2007
- Economic Planning Unit, The Second Outline Perspective Plan 1990–2000: Human Resource Development, Prime Minister's Department, Government of Malaysia, 1990
- Economic Planning Unit, The Second Outline Perspective Plan 1990–2000: Manpower Development, Prime Minister's Department, Government of Malaysia, 1990
- Economic Planning Unit, The Third Outline Perspective Plan 2001–2010: Developing Malaysia into a Knowledge-Based Economy, Prime Minister's Department, Government of Malaysia, 2001
- English L & Guthrie J, 'Driving Privately Financed Projects in Australia: What Makes them Tick?', Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, vol.16, no.3, 2003
- Foong S & Somchit B, 'Penang, Malaysia: A Smart Public-Private Partnership: An Example of a Government-led Initiative', Saigon Hi-Tech Park News, 8 August 2007
- Geddes M, *Making Public Private Partnerships Work: Building Relationships and Understanding Cultures*, Gower Publishing, United Kingdom, 2005
- Harvey R, Meisling A & Sammari H, 'Better Work: Promoting Labour Standards Through Responsible Competitiveness', Better Work Report, Better Work, July 2007
- Human Resources and Social Development Canada, Sector Council Program: FAQ, Government of Canada, 2008
- Human Resources and Social Development Canada, Sector Council Program: Program Information, Government of Canada, 2008
- Institute for Public Policy Research, *Building Better Partnerships*, Institute for Public Policy Research, London, 2001
- International Finance Corporation (IFC), *Building garment industry productivity and competitiveness in Cambodia*, Mekong Private Sector Development Facility, 2008
- International Labour Office (ILO), *Public-Private Partnerships in Employment Services*, ILO, Geneva, 2003
- More M H, *Creating Public Value Through Private/Public Partnerships*, Harvard University, USA, 2005
- Penang Skill Development Centre (PSDC), 'History', PSDC, Malaysia, 2008

- Philippines Information Agency (PIA), 'Latest UN Report Backs up ABK Initiative's Call Vs Child Labor', PIA Press Release, PIA, 25 May 2005
- PriceWaterhouseCoopers, Delivering the PPP Promise: A Review of PPP Issues and Activity, PriceWaterhouseCoopers, 2005
- Productivity Commission, Independent Review of the Job Network, Report no.21, Australian Government, Canberra, June 2002
- Quiggin J, 'Public-Private Partnerships: Options for Improved Risk Allocation', The Australian Economic Review, The University of Melbourne, vol.38, no.4, 2005
- Rojvithee A, *Skill Development Strategies PowerPoint Presentation*, Thailand Ministry of Labour, Hong Kong, 2007
- Singapore Human Resources Institute (SHRI), 'About SHRI', SHRI, 2008
- Teicher J, Alam Q & Van Gramberg B, 'Managing Trust and Relationships in PPPs: Some Australian Experiences', International Review of Administrative Sciences, vol.72, no.85, 2006
- United States Department of Labor Employment and Training Administration, The President's High Growth Job Training Initiative, Government of the United States of America, USA, 2007
- United States Department of Labor, 'Identifying and Addressing Workforce Challenges in America's Retail Industry', Government of the United States of America, USA, 2007
- United States Department of Labor, Employment and Training Administration (ETA), 'One-Stop Career Centers', Government of the United States of America, USA, 2007
- United States Department of Labor Employment and Training Administration, 'The President's Community-Based Job Training Grants', Government of the United States of America, USA, 2008
- United States Department of Labor, Employment and Training Administration (ETA), 'Workforce Investment Act of 1998—Public Law 105-220—August 7 1998', Government of the United States of America, USA, 1998
- Urban Institute Center on Labour, Human Services and Population, Implementation and Sustainability: Emerging Lessons from the Early High Growth Job Training Initiative (HGJTI) Grants, United States Department of Labor, USA, 2007
- Wang Y, Lee A & Lin Y, Effects of Multi-Employment Promotion Program and their Predictors: An Example of 2004 Multi-Employment Promotion Program, Taiwan Institute of Social Welfare, Taiwan, 2008
- Webster E & Harding G, 'Outsourcing Public Employment Services: The Australian Experience', The Australian Economic Review, vol.34, no.2, 2001
- Workforce Development Agency (WDA), WDA Annual Report 2006/07, WDA, Singapore, 2007
- Workforce Development Agency (WDA), Vision, Mission and Key Functions, WDA, Singapore, 2008
- Workforce Development Agency (WDA), Place and Train Programs: Overview, WDA, Singapore, 2006
- Working Group for International Cooperation in Skill Development, 'Skill Development Policies and International Cooperation in East and South-East Asia', *Debates in Skill Development Paper 11*, Network for Policy Research, Review and Advice on Education and Training, Hong Kong, 2007
- World Bank, Defining Civil Society, World Bank, 2008
- World Bank, 'World Bank Supports Vocational Training in India with US\$280 Million', *Press Release*, World Bank, 5 June 2007